UNITED
NATIONS

TD

United Nations Conference
on Trade and Development

Distr.
GENERAL

TD/B/C.4/331
18 April 1990

Original: ENGLISH

TRADE AND DEVELOPMENT BOARD
Committee on Shipping
Fourteenth session
Geneva, 21 June 1990

EVALUATION OF THE TECHNICAL CO-OPERATION PROGRAMME IN THE FIELD OF MARITIME AND MULTIMODAL TRANSPORT

Report by the UNCTAD secretariat

CONTENTS

		Paragraphs
Introduction and summary		1 - 2
Conclusions and Recommendations		3 - 4
Chapter		
I.	General aspects of the programme	5 - 12
	A. Main features of the programme during the period 1980-1988	5 - 7
	B. Financing of the programme	8 - 9
	C. Management structure	10 - 12
II.	Objectives and results of the programme	13 - 91

GE.90-51083/1848B

best copy available

CONTENTS (continued)

Chapter		Paragraphs
	A. TRAINMAR	
	- Description and objectives of TRAINMAR	14 - 20
	- Assessment of TRAINMAR	21 - 43
	B. Ports including IPP	44 - 72
	B.1 Improving port performance (IPP)	44 - 65
	- Description and objectives of IPP	44 - 50
	- Assessment of IPP	51 - 65
	B.2 Other port projects	66 - 72
	C. Shipping other than TRAINMAR	73 - 80
	D. Other activities	81 - 91
III.	Overall assessment, including summary of conclusions and recommendations	92 - 120
	A. General assessment	92 - 97
	B. Interaction of the programme with research activities	98 - 104
	C. Guidelines for the selection of projects and priorities	105 - 111
	D. Improvement of project design, implementation and follow-up	112 - 117
	E. National support and sustainability	118 - 120
IV.	Inter-agency co-operation	121 - 125

READEX FICHE

Introduction and summary

1. The present report has been prepared pursuant to a request addressed by the Committee on Shipping in its resolution 61 (XIII) to the secretariat to "submit to the fourteenth session of the Committee a comprehensive evaluation of the technical assistance programme provided by UNCTAD in the field of shipping, ports and multimodal transport, including an analysis of the costs and, if feasible, practical benefits of such a programme and an indication of the guidelines and priorities followed by UNCTAD in responding to a request for assistance and to report in a background document to the Committee on Shipping".

2. The report has been prepared by the Programme Co-ordination and Evaluation Unit, under its own responsibility, in co-operation with the Shipping Division and in consultation with the Joint Technical Co-operation Unit. It is based essentially on desk research and interviews held in Geneva, and on a number of external inputs, notably several UNDP-led in-depth evaluations of TRAINMAR and an in-depth evaluation of IPP by the Swedish International Development Authority (SDA). The analysis of the projects implemented by the Shipping Division during the period 1980-1988 is summarized in the main report as well as in Annex I. For technical reasons, Annexes 1, II and III are issued as an addendum to this report.

Conclusions

3. The general conclusions are:

- The total value of the 81 projects implemented during the period 1980-1988 amounted to $24,759,000, accounting for about 24 per cent of the overall technical co-operation programme of UNCTAD for the period;

- The most important component of the maritime and multimodal transport programme during the period has been the training projects, accounting for 52 per cent of the total programme. The non-training activities included: ports (20 per cent); shipping (8 per cent); and others covering multimodal transport, maritime legislation and multisectoral projects (20 per cent);

- Ports activities, including the Improving Port Performance (IPP) training programme, constituted the highest proportion (30 per cent) after TRAINMAR (40 per cent); if it is assuming that half of the TRAINMAR resources used was ports-related, a fair assumption, ports activities alone (both training and other activities) would account for about 50 per cent of the total programme;

- The other activities inclusive of training included shipping (9 per cent) and others, covering multimodal transport, maritime legislation and multisectoral aspects (21 per cent);

- The main outputs up to 1988 include: the establishment or strengthening of training institutions by over 20 developing countries, joined by a number of regional or subregional networks, co-ordinated interregionally by UNCTAD, which have successfully promoted exchanges of experiences and training materials and instructors as a form of TCDC; the creation of training capabilities

in developing countries in terms of the training of 235 course developers and 460 instructors; the training of nearly 14,000 shipping and ports managers and other transport executives from developing countries at different levels of management in a wide range of subjects; the development, both centrally and locally, of 34 validated courses, together with 70 adaptations, for the training of shipping and port managers and other transport executives; the development of a computer simulation game for shipping decision-making (STRATSHIP) and of software programmes for aiding multimodal transport operations (MULTISHIP); and the successful application of techniques, procedures, systems, equipment and technologies, including information technology, and of various institutional innovations and arrangements in a wide range of developing countries;

- Some of the TRAINMAR centres and networks show promise of sustainability and, since courses are available, can continue to generate outputs of trained personnel without external support. However, a further period of continued international support will still be necessary, together with national support, in order to consolidate these and other centres and networks towards the objective of technical and financial self-sufficiency;

- Substantial results have thus been achieved, although it is difficult to quantify the benefits, e.g. of a corps of trained course developers and instructors or of the training institutions themselves which can generate long-term multiplier effects; further, the programme has tackled a wide variety of problems in an effective manner;

- The innovative approach will continue to be needed in the future, with the advent of new technology and other developments and the evolution to more integrated systems of transport and distribution. However, training is likely to remain an important component as individual programmes or as part of project activities, even if international support for certain activities may progressively decline as the established training institutions move towards self-sustainability.

Recommendations

4. The recommendations of the study are as follows:

- Action on a recommendation to discontinue the SHIPASSIST Directory (para. 91);

- Granting of the right status to training institutions and adequate incentives to training personnel in order to help ensure stability and sustainability of training institutions and training capability (para. 118);

- Commitment of local support for project implementation and follow-up in order to help ensure the success of the project and the sustainability of its results (para. 120);

- Implementation of the action plan for TRAINMAR and the recommendations arising from the IPP evaluation; further co-ordination of TRAINMAR and IPP in order to enhance their complementarities; organization of a

major fund raising effort in order to consolidate the training programme towards self-sustainable development with minimum international support; contribution to the formulation of human resources development policies, taking account of future needs and orientations; updating of the assessment of the training needs in the field of maritime and multimodal transport (para. 95);

- Expansion and diversification to the fullest extent possible of the sources of external expertise from the use of external consultants (para. 103);

- Ensuring that additional support costs arising from an expansion of technical co-operation activities are distributed to the fullest extent possible, consistent with the requirements of the central support function, among the Divisions and Programmes which have generated the increase and which sustain their technical co-operation programmes (para. 109);

- Use of guidelines, as appropriate, for the choice of projects (para. 111);

- Specification and monitoring of project performance indicators as part of good project design and effective project implementation and follow-up; early establishment of the project monitoring system (para. 113);

- Extension of the innovations in the areas of dissemination and feedback not only within the Division but also to other parts of the secretariat (para. 114);

- Working with IMO and ILO, as well as with other bodies, towards the strengthening of inter-agency co-operation (para. 115).

I. GENERAL ASPECTS OF THE PROGRAMME

A. Main features of the programme during the period 1980-1988

5. The technical co-operation programme in the field of maritime and multimodal transport began effectively to be implemented at the beginning of the 1970s. It has covered a wide variety of activities ranging from operational assistance through training and advisory services to assistance in the formulation of shipping policies and investment decisions. During the period 1980-1988 it has accounted on average for 24 per cent of the total UNCTAD technical assistance programme, reaching a peak of 30 per cent in 1987.

6. During the same period UNCTAD implemented a total of 81 projects in the field of maritime transport with a total value of $24,759,000. The cost of projects varied from $10,000 at the lower end to $2 million at the upper scale. Nearly half of the total resources was allocated to national projects, the rest being distributed between regional ($6,290,300) and interregional projects ($6,550,900). Out of the 81 projects, 43 were at the national level, 18 at the regional level and 20 at the interregional level.

7. For the purpose of this evaluation, the activities undertaken are grouped into four categories: TRAINMAR (Training Development in the Field of Maritime Transport); ports including IPP (Improving Port Performance); shipping other than TRAINMAR; and other activities. The TRAINMAR programme has accounted for 40 per cent of the total resources, followed by ports (30 per cent), shipping (9 per cent) and others (21 per cent). Almost 52 per cent of the resources has been devoted to training activities with the two major training programmes (TRAINMAR and IPP) accounting for about 49 per cent of the total resources. As regards the various budgetary components, the most significant component has consisted of provisions for experts, consultants, fellowships and related costs; the other component, procurement of equipment, has represented only a small proportion of the total resources.

B. Financing of the programme

8. UNDP has been the main source of financing, having provided 83 per cent of the total resources. Some 17 per cent has been provided by bilateral donors, including Belgium, France, Norway, the Netherlands, Sweden and the EEC, as well as various beneficiary countries.

9. With a few exceptions, the financing of national projects has been provided by UNDP. For regional projects, the UNDP has continued to remain the dominant source of funding, although there has been a contribution from other donors (4 per cent), including the EEC and international financial institutions (World Bank, Islamic Development Bank). For interregional projects the financing from sources other than UNDP has been even higher (45 per cent), due to a significant contribution from bilateral donors, including Belgium, France, Norway, the Netherlands and Sweden.

C. Management structure

10. The Shipping Division is made up of the Director's Office, four sections dealing respectively with shipping, ports, maritime legislation and multimodal transport, a Co-ordinator for Technical Co-operation and Training, the Central Support Team (CST) for TRAINMAR and the Registrar for the UN Convention on a Code of Conduct for Liner Conferences. For practically the whole period under review, the responsibilities for programme co-ordination and support for the development of the programme of technical co-operation and training in the field of maritime and multimodal transport were vested in an Operations Unit. The Unit issued an annual report on technical co-operation and training activities which was helpful for monitoring the development of the programme as a whole. The Unit, whose head also served as project officer for TRAINMAR played a key role in the development of TRAINMAR, together with the former TRAINMAR Co-ordinator. The responsibilities of the Operations Unit have been assumed by the Co-ordinator for Technical Co-operation and Training since his appointment in May 1989.

11. New arrangements for the management of technical co-operation activities in the UNCTAD secretariat as a whole were introduced in mid-1988. In essence, they provide for the centralization of the functions of overall policy direction and management; programme development; priority setting; the promotion of a more integrated approach to technical co-operation; the mobilization of resources; and the monitoring of performance, as well as of the administrative aspects, including recruitment, contracting, procurement and maintenance of projects. The monitoring of performance and of basic

project data is to be computerized by the establishment of a project monitoring system, which is under development. Various other functions have been decentralized to the substantive Divisions and Programmes, including those relating to the formulation and implementation of projects; the selection of project personnel and the organization of training courses; review and supervision of project implementation, including the preparation of relevant reports; and assurance of flows of information on project activities and results.

12. The various responsibilities devolving upon the Shipping Division in respect of its projects are assumed by the substantive officers concerned who also serve as project officers for their respective projects. The Co-ordinator, in addition to responsibility for programme co-ordination, support for programme development and the promotion of interaction between research and technical co-operation activities also has executive responsibility for TRAINMAR. The Chief of the CST serves also as TRAINMAR Co-ordinator and project officer for TRAINMAR.

II. OBJECTIVES AND RESULTS OF THE PROGRAMME

13. The descriptions and assessments of the different activities are organized into the four categories indicated above. The assessments of ongoing training programmes and advisory services, based in each case on a global analysis, are contained in the appropriate sections of the report. Analyses of specific individual projects are set out in Annex I, although some salient features of these projects are briefly described in the appropriate sections.

A. TRAINMAR

Description and objectives of TRAINMAR

14. The objectives are (i) to develop or strengthen maritime management training institutions and capacities in developing countries so that they can progressively cover all their training requirements in a systematic and cost-effective way; and (ii) to promote co-operation among the participating countries in the field of maritime training. Emphasis has been given in the methodology to the development or strengthening of national training institutions through national projects, regional collaboration and central advice and support; the training of local instructors and of course developers; systematic analysis of performance deficiencies with a view to elaborating performance or job-oriented training programmes; development of high-quality training material to be validated and used locally and, with suitable adaption, in many other participating or co-operating countries; and creation and co-ordinated development of regional and interregional systems of co-operation through a world-wide network of institutions linked together by the use of common methods and which agree to share their experiences and training resources. In the more recent phase, in order to make the most effective use of scarce training resources and to improve communications between the operations and training sectors, directors and managers of participating TRAINMAR centres have also been trained in the administration of training centres and the organization of training programmes.

15. The world-wide network has been established by UNCTAD via a number of projects funded by the UNDP at interregional, regional and national levels. The network has also received financial support from bilateral donors including France and the EEC. In some cases (Tunisia, Mexico, Morocco, Malaysia), the funding has been provided by the respective Governments, either entirely or partially through cost-sharing schemes. Other local inputs in the form of counterparts, accommodation, secretarial support, etc. have also been provided by the participating institutions. A number of centres in developed countries, including Federal Republic of Germany, United Kingdom, United States and Union of Soviet Socialist Republics, have collaborated with the network. The next phase is aimed at consolidating and reinforcing the programme on a self-sustaining basis, including the development of plans to make the network self-financing through membership contributions.

16. Beginning with the implementation of a pilot project in 1980, the programme has been reviewed by UNDP, UNCTAD and participating countries and extended at successive intervals, including a review held in 1983 and another held in 1988 in Bremen (Federal Republic of Germany). A five-year plan for 1986-1990 was elaborated in 1985 for the further development of the programme towards substantial self-reliance with minimum international support.

17. The implementation of TRAINMAR is co-ordinated from UNCTAD headquarters by the CST, working in close collaboration with the rest of the Shipping Division. The team ensures overall co-ordination of all TRAINMAR projects. It is responsible for the design and structuring of the programme, and ensures, in collaboration with the substantive sections of the Division, that standards are maintained for both training and technical content in all participating centres. The team provides training for course developers and instructors, normally in the centres.

18. At present, 23 national and regional training centres are integrated with the programme, with most of them being port centres, as follows:

Algeria - Algiers (ports)
Egypt - Alexandria (mainly ports)
Côte d'Ivoire - Abidjan (ports and shipping)
Guadaloupe - Guadaloupe (ports and shipping)
Guatemala - Guatemala (ports)
India - Bombay (two centres, one for ports, the other for shipping)
India - Calcutta (ports)
India - Madras (mainly ports)
Kenya - Mombasa (ports) Malaysia - Johore (mainly ports)
Malaysia - Penang (mainly ports)
Mexico - Mexico (mainly ports)
Morocco - Casablanca (ports)
Mozambique - Maputo (ports and shipping)
Nicaragua - Managua, for the Central American region (mainly ports)
Peru - El Callao (ports)
Philippines - Manila (two centres, one for ports, the other for shipping)
Sri Lanka - Colombo (ports)
Thailand - Bangkok (mainly shipping)
Tunisia - Tunis (ports)
United Arab Emirates - Sharjah, for the Arab region (mainly shipping)

In addition to the above, 20 other centres are also associated with the programme.

19. The 23 centres have teams of course-developers and instructors capable of adapting and implementing TRAINMAR courses. Of these, 8 to 10 centres have the capability to develop new courses with minimal outside assistance. Up to 1988, 32 courses had been developed both centrally and locally. Five other courses developed in 1989 have for the most part been validated. The courses last from a few days to a month. They rely on the most appropriate combination of the following techniques: group training and individualized study; case-studies and business games; and audio-visual programmes. A full list is given in Annex III. In addition, training guidelines have been developed centrally. They include: Training Development Guidelines; Training Adaptation Guidelines; and Training Management Reference Guide.

20. Regional or subregional networks linking these centres have been established and are co-ordinated by the CST. Some of them are fairly well developed with several years of experience of co-operation on course development and exchanges of training materials and instructors, including the networks for Asia and the Pacific, the Arab/North Africa region and the

French-speaking countries of West Africa. More recently, the Central American network has also promoted exchanges among the centres concerned, and regional co-operation in the Caribbean region has started to be developed. Networks for other regions are likewise being developed.

Table 1: Quantitative indicators

	1980-1983	1984-1986	1987-1988	1980-1988 (total)	Target output
Number of centres established	8	11	4	23	30
Number of courses developed	9	15	8	32	50
Number of courses adapted	-	-	-	70	98
Number of course developers trained	60	120	55	235	272
Number of instructors trained	65	93	65	223	307
Number of training managers trained	-	29	35	64	51
Number of port or shipping managers trained: total	1 120	5 050	3 000	9 170	13 000
Average per year	280	1 680	1 500	1 020 (for later years only)	3 000-4 000
Average number of deliveries	12	80	140	90 (for later years only)	200
Total cost of programme (up to 1988)	-	-	-	$8.3 m	
Total cost of equipment (15 per cent of total costs)	-	-	-	$1.3 m	

Assessment of TRAINMAR 1/

Output of trained personnel

21. In general, a high proportion of the planned output has been achieved, as indicated in Table 1. In the case of training managers instructed, the planned output has even been exceeded. However, the average number of port and shipping managers trained per year in the later years in relation to the target for that period was less satisfactory. Now that the centres have been established and offer suitable courses, the output of trained personnel can continue to grow even without UNCTAD intervention.

Course development

22. While TRAINMAR has achieved widespread success in terms of effective course deliveries, less success has been achieved in course development and course adaptation. Both the level of new course development and the quality of more recent courses have been dropping. A high turnover of course developers has been observed in Asia and East Africa. However, greater stability has been perceived in West and North Africa. There is thus room for improvement with regard to the development and adaptation of courses. Various factors contributing to inadequacy in both quantity and quality may be identified, including the intellectual ability of course developers, their training, involvement of line managers and external quality control. Each of these factors could be improved but action would be needed at many levels, including Governments, top managers, training managers and the CST, with inputs from the substantive sections of the Division.

23. As regards the training of course developers, there is a need (i) to create conditions that will attract the right applicants and reduce the turnover rate through greater incentives in terms of status, salaries and other benefits including housing and career possibilities; (ii) to provide better and longer training, as well as selective on-the-job advice until self-sufficiency is achieved; (iii) to involve line managers more actively in the training process, perhaps by providing training to them as well, so that they can recognize the benefits in terms of operational improvements that can result directly from training and take initiatives themselves to use training resources and training in an optimal manner. A good example of proper status and career conditions for trainers has been observed in the Abidjan Academy, which may be studied as a model for other TRAINMAR centres.

24. A small proportion of the courses developed (about 15 per cent) have not been of acceptable quality standards for international exchange. This underlines the need for more rigorous quality control which seems to be slackening recently, since the methodology alone cannot guarantee the development of first-class courses. There is also room for improvement in terms of developing a standard "house style" for the presentation of courses.

25. It should be noted that the experience has been a mixture of local and centralized course development. Some locally developed courses have met difficulties in terms of straight-forward adaptation because of too much local content or because of insufficient quality. However, there have been many successful adaptations of locally developed courses involving generally no more than 30 per cent adaptation of the course material. The TRAINMAR approach has the merit of encouraging self-sufficiency in terms of developing

local capacity to identify operational and other deficiencies and to develop courses that are tailor-made to overcome such shortcomings, in addition to technical co-operation among developing countries in terms of the exchanges of experience, course materials and instructors. These objectives are worth supporting even if performance is not always up to an "ideal" standard. However, there may be instances where a management problem is so widespread that a "core" course dealing with the main elements of the problem may be developed first, to which local elements may be added later, or where a target population is so small as to render prohibitive the cost of locally developed courses.

Centres and networks

26. The great diversity in types of centres (from regional academies to local training departments) and the varied performances (from successful and active centres to languishing ones), as well as the varying potential among them, combined with the limited resources available to the CST, have led to the need to establish a new system of co-operation and support between the CST and the 23 centres which would ensure that help is available to all centres, but entailing different levels of direct support from the CST corresponding to the different levels of needs of the centres.

27. A total of 10 to 12 main centres would, at present, appear to be a practical limit for efficient co-operation with the CST. Course development and regional activities would be concentrated at these main centres. Other centres (associate centres), which should at least have a capacity to identify training needs and to deliver selected courses, would be members of TRAINMAR but would normally co-ordinate their activities through a main centre. Such a scheme of main and associate centres is in line with the proposals presented to a TRAINMAR review meeting held in Bremen (Federal Republic of Germany) in 1988 which envisaged an arrangement involving resource centres as well as full and associate members.

28. It would be necessary for main centres to be sufficiently motivated to undertake activities with regional or interregional rather than just local objectives. Some positive experience in this area has already been gained through the established resource centres, including those in Madras, Johore and Mexico, which will have a key role to play, complementary to that of the CST, particularly in promoting technical co-operation among the centres.

29. Criteria for the choice of main centres are being developed. They should include a centre's ability to correct many of the problems already identified, such as the need for continuity of staff, interest and involvement on the part of line managers, etc. and factors such as physical facilities and the centre's status within the local maritime community.

30. Sufficient evidence is not yet available to indicate whether all the regional and subregional networks can sustain their activities without external support. However, it appears that, without a minimum level of continued regional assistance, the benefits of past efforts may be lost. Continued support for the development and strengthening of the networks is essential for the consolidation and sustainability of the TRAINMAR programme. This support should, in the long run, be organized through direct external finance or a range of co-operation activities involving richer, more

experienced centres bringing their own sources of finance. It has been suggested that if TRAINMAR could pay some regional staff, such as regional co-ordinators, this would ensure better performance.

31. A distinct difference in the status and prestige of centres in anglophone and francophone countries has been noted. Attention should be given to the circumstances which have led to stability and success in the Abidjan centre in particular, including its ability to attract academically well-qualified persons. However, the need to associate academics with persons having practical experience at all levels should also be borne in mind.

32. As regards the involvement of training centres from industrialized countries, this can succeed only where a satisfactory incentive can be found for them. Further, the principle of collaborative ventures between more and less experienced centres will need to be examined closely. Such ventures would call for external financial support, but would provide inputs beyond the means of individual centres or where the benefits are too diverse or long-term to interest any single centre. This can perhaps be married to the interests of bilateral donors or the World Bank, and one aim of UNCTAD should be eventually to arrange for activities to be funded on a regular basis by such sources. The CST would need to play an important co-ordinating role in this regard.

33. It should remain a cornerstone of TRAINMAR that member centres be expected to pay the cost of local network activities and make a financial contribution to cover the costs of support provided on pedagogic and technical matters. However, this goal will be very difficult to achieve until there is a thriving network in which each centre can participate. In particular the CST, together with the resource centres, will need to demonstrate the value of their support, by providing more on-the-spot services both to centres and to networks, and by bringing the benefits to the attention of national authorities. This might need support by UNDP-financed projects.

Role of CST

34. Many of the problems encountered in the implementation of TRAINMAR in the recent period were indicative of the need for greater support from the CST. Many centres had no resident expert and this was a cause of reduced activity and lowered standards. Hopes that momentum and quality would be maintained through regional co-operation arrangements have not been realized. Direct support from the CST, with full backing from UNCTAD, would seem to be needed more than ever before.

35. The role and structure of the CST will also need to match the evolving needs of the networks, including such duties as the management of networks, pedagogic support, programming assistance and the handling of administrative logistics. While steps have been taken to strengthen the CST (with three professionals to provide direct support and management and to cover the key complementary languages needed, plus three GS staff for non-technical backup), this is perhaps a minimum acceptable strength for the functions envisaged. The filling of various vacancies in the Division would obviously allow better support to be provided to the CST.

36. It is essential for the CST, as much as for the TRAINMAR centres, that posts be occupied by truly motivated individuals with the right aptitudes. Of

particular importance is the post of Training Management Advisor which is the source of pedagogic support and which cannot be provided within the resources available to UNCTAD. All potential sources of finance need to be pursued in order to provide stability to this post as the CST would effectively cease to function without such pedagogic support.

37. Further, extra resources will be required for the reorganization of TRAINMAR along the lines indicated above during a period when routine demands on the CST will probably exceed its capacity. As such demands cannot be met from resources for technical co-operation, UNCTAD will have to request a further period of assistance from the interregional programme of UNDP.

Impact of TRAINMAR

38. The TRAINMAR programme, incorporating as it does a reliable methodology which can be widely applied, has demonstrated its effectiveness as perhaps the best possible means of helping developing countries to develop their own capacity for maritime management training. Despite various problems observed, with contributory causes ranging from inadequate local support to insufficient quality control, TRAINMAR courses have tended to form the backbone of maritime management training in many countries.

39. TRAINMAR's impact can be judged by the fact that it has been instrumental in the establishment of training institutions and permanent maritime training capacity where none existed before in a number of countries, including Côte d'Ivoire, India, Mexico, Morocco and Mozambique, as well as in a number of regions, including the Arab region (Sharjah) and the Central American region (Managua). It has also contributed to the strengthening of existing institutions and capacities. There is also evidence of sustainability to the extent that most institutions are still functioning even without external assistance. Further, even if the training standards applied during the execution of the projects are not maintained, the standards still remain higher than before.

40. One example of sustainability is the experience in Malaysia, where a scheme of financial contributions by ports was drawn up for the running of the TRAINMAR programme, together with the establishment of a national training committee under the auspices of the Ministry of Transport, with co-ordination provided by the resource centre in Johore. Similar approaches have been adopted or are being applied for the financing of national training schemes in other countries, including Algeria, India and Morocco .

41. TRAINMAR has also contributed to creating the conditions for "collective self-reliance" and technical co-operation among developing countries through the networks of co-operating TRAINMAR centres. This objective remains an important one, and will need to be pursued. As Mr. G. Tarr, a former member of the CST has observed, "The heart of the philosophy is the principle of harnessing local training resources in a co-operative network and hence obtaining multiple effect without losing specificity."

42. A number of unforeseen benefits have also been observed, in particular a clear increase in consciousness and professionalism throughout training, and an increased awareness of the importance of human resources development issues.

Action plan

43. Subsequent to the UNDP/UNCTAD evaluation conducted in 1989 (see footnote 2/), an action plan has been drawn up giving the future directions and detailing follow-up actions. This action plan is reproduced below.

ACTION PLAN

Prompt action should be initiated by UNCTAD in the following areas:

1. TRAINMAR strategy

   1.1 Review the current five-year plan; extend and revise it in the light of the evaluation so as to achieve a satisfactory stable position by 1992.

   1.2 Prepare an outline plan for operation and development of networks in each region over the period up to 1999.

2. Network organization

   2.1 Inform TRAINMAR centres of conclusions emerging from the evaluation.

   2.2 In consultation with the TRAINMAR centres, define the role of the main and associate centres (based on paper discussed at Bremen meeting), including outline operating procedures for global and regional networks.

   2.3 Prepare an inventory of TRAINMAR centres and their capabilities.

   2.4 Define criteria appropriate for main and associate centres and make a provisional classification among existing centres to include up to 12 main centres.

   2.5 Identify potential co-operating centres in industrialized countries.

   2.6 Organize meetings of representatives of centres with common interests.

3. Reinforcement of centres

   3.1 Prepare guidelines on centre staffing, management, and relationships with industry.

   3.2 Prepare recommendations on incentive schemes to retain competent course developers and instructors.

   3.3 Estimate resource needs (staff and operating budgets) for each centre.

   3.4 Visit centres and corresponding authorities to agree conditions of continued participation.

4. Course development

4.1 Promote decentralized course development activities under overall management of the CST.

4.2 Reinforce procedures for quality control through the CST's training management adviser.

4.3 Develop the scope for a core course approach.

4.4 Develop and expand the activities of human-resources development involving the TRAINMAR approach.

4.5 Define and promote collaborative ventures under overall co-ordination by the CST.

4.6 Revise the two-course development workshops.

4.7 Investigate supplements to current course development training, including apprenticeships and selected attendance at long courses (e.g. at the Turin centre).

4.8 Develop a system of course certification and a house style for approved courses.

4.9 Update the Couper-Couroux report on training needs of the maritime industry.

4.10 Outline the broad scope of course development for 1990-1992.

5. Consolidation of UNCTAD support

5.1 Define the nature of support to be provided to TRAINMAR main centres, notably in the fields of training management, pedagogy, technical subjects, documentation, programme management and administration.

5.2 Quantify the support to be provided by the CST, the Co-ordinator of Technical Co-operation and Training and technical staff of the Shipping Division, and UNCTAD's other advisory and support services.

5.3 Ensure that the CST can cover satisfactorily activities conducted in at least the three languages: English, French and Spanish.

5.4 Define managerial responsibility for TRAINMAR within UNCTAD in relation to broad-based support and co-operation, and in relation to immediate changes required in the context of the action plan.

5.5 Develop a system of co-ordination of all UNCTAD's maritime training activities.

5.6 Establish a steering committee to advise on TRAINMAR development.

5.7 Prepare an information package explaining TRAINMAR to potential participants and donors.

6. Interagency co-operation

6.1 Continue active co-operation in the Interagency Maritime Training Group convened between ILO, IMO and UNCTAD.

6.2 Establish reciprocal co-operation arrangements for working level participation by IMO (including WMU), ILO, ITC, ITU, ICAO and others in regular meetings of TRAINMAR.

6.3 Make every effort to participate, in the context of reciprocal co-operation arrangements, in the WMU Board of Governors' meetings.

7. Funding

7.1 Eventually assume full responsibility for the financial support of the CST as a permanent part of UNCTAD.

7.2 Ensure that UNCTAD regular resources continue to provide for the posts of TRAINMAR Co-ordinator, Materials Officer, Administrative Assistant and Secretary, and that the post of Junior Expert continues to be filled from these or extrabudgetary resources.

7.3 Pursue ways and means to cover the pedagogical post of Training Management Adviser (as agreed when INT/88/001 was signed).

7.4 Seek UNDP regional support to ensure assistance at a minimal essential level to regional networks, or UNDP national support at key centres where appropriate.

7.5 Develop and promote proposals for widespread financing in the medium term of specific activities or support by potential donor countries, commercial organizations and interested institutions.

7.6 Request UNDP/DGIP for transitional funding to provide continuity of support while above measures are put into effect or conditions created for their implementation. The basis for this request would be a clear statement of the current position of the TRAINMAR network, an action plan up to 1992 and a strategy extending to 1999, together with the necessary supporting documentation arising from subsections 1.2, 2.3, 2.4, 3.1, 3.2, 3.3, 4.10, 5 and 7 above.

B. Ports including IPP

B.1. Improving Port Performance (IPP)

Description and objectives of IPP

44. The long-term objective of the IPP programme is to upgrade the quality of port management training in developing countries, while assisting local training centres to become self-reliant. An immediate objective is the centralized preparation of validated material, together with the training of port management instructors and the support of training programmes in developing countries.

45. The IPP programme has been administered by the Shipping Division and financed since 1979 by donations received from the Swedish International Development Authority (SIDA).

46. The IPP programme started in 1980 with the development of a course on the management of general cargo operations (IPP-1) targeted at junior and middle-level port managers of developing countries from both the public and private sectors. In practice, the training has covered stevedoring managers, port traffic officers and berth superintendents, aiming at helping them better to plan and organize the handling of cargoes in ports and make the most efficient use of available resources.

47. The course has been developed in close collaboration with Dr. Brian Thomas of the University of Wales and the material has been produced and distributed by a specialist company (Drake Educational Associates), in Wales. The original English version of the course was completed in 1982 then translated into other languages, including Arabic, French, Portuguese and Spanish. In addition, some countries have translated the material into their own languages including Chinese, Korean and Bahasa Indonesia. Supplies of the course material are distributed to regional and national training centres including TRAINMAR centres.

48. The training material comprises a series of 18 audio-visual programmes, a comprehensive workbook and a trainer's handbook. It is intended to permit any port with a minimum of readily available resources to organize regular four- to five-week courses for the training of its supervisory staff, in addition to a range of shorter courses for specialized workers.

49. Following the same approach as IPP-1, another training course has been developed. This course, on container terminal development policy (IPP-2), consists of a series of case studies and exercises dealing with such subjects as planning strategies, container terminal development, equipment selection, and container terminal organization. It is supported by a set of six video programmes. IPP-2, to be given in the form of policy seminars, is intended for senior civil servants, chairmen and managing directors of ports and other organizations responsible for cargo operations, as well as planners and departmental heads of ports. The course is already operational and several seminars have already been organized.

50. In addition, a policy seminar on equipment management: policy, management and maintenance (IPP-3), targeted at policy makers is intended to acquaint them with the policy issues involved in establishing an efficient

port equipment management and maintenance function. It has been developed to complement TRAINMAR course 2.9 on management of equipment maintenance. It was validated in Jamaica in December 1989 with the participation of the World Bank and was scheduled to be delivered in the Republic of Tanzania in June 1990 in co-operation with the World Bank. Another seminar course being developed on equipment procurement (IPP-4) is targeted at key officials responsible for obtaining equipment. The object is to equip participants with the necessary knowledge and skills in this area. Steps are being taken to finalize IPP-4 in order to integrate it into an overall training strategy for port equipment covering all the relevant courses available to UNCTAD and incorporating various other elements developed by UNCTAD in co-operation with the World Bank. Such a strategy can also include co-operation with IMO and ILO in their respective fields of competence in order to cover the entire range of training needs.

Assessment of IPP 2/

Quantitative analysis

51. According to statistics collected by the Shipping Division, IPP, or parts thereof, has been delivered to about 3,600 people in 46 countries during the period 1983 to 1988. A number of countries, including India, Ethiopia, Pakistan, Ghana, Cuba, Sudan and Peru, have made the most extensive use of IPP-1. In addition, the course has been delivered in the People's Republic of China, the Republic of Korea and a few other countries from which no information on course deliveries has been received. Overall, it is estimated that up to the end of 1989 some 5,000 people around the world had followed the course or parts of it. During the same period, 238 instructors from 61 countries have attended IPP-1 seminars for instructors conducted in Cardiff (United Kingdom), Mombasa (Kenya), Abidjan (Côte d'Ivoire), Buenos Aires (Argentina), Shanghai (People's Republic of China), Seoul (Republic of Korea) and Jakarta (Indonesia).

52. The cost of the development and delivery of the IPP-1 course amounted to $US 1,700,000 up to 1988. This amount includes the cost of the training of instructors and managers but does not include local expenditures, such as participants' expenses and instructors' salaries.

Training material

53. The training material has been assessed against various criteria, including its relevance to trainee job needs, its quality, the comprehensiveness, depth and accuracy of its technical contents, ease of use by trainers and ease of understanding by trainees. The conclusion reached is that the course is of good quality and that its content has been relevant to the target audience, e.g. middle and junior level managers. The training material has been judged relevant to the trainees' job needs, and, with few exceptions, to the conditions prevailing in the ports. The trainees themselves have evaluated the training material as good or very good in respect of the coverage, depth and accuracy of its technical content. Moreover, most of the trainees have found the course fairly easy to follow and practical.

54. However, those whose mother tongue was not English have experienced some difficulty in understanding the English version of the course. In this respect, it appears that, in the specific target population of IPP-1, there has been a definite demand limit in the occupations where the course could be used. In most of the ports visited, it was indicated that the English version of the course had already been provided to the targeted group and that there was a great need for the course to be translated into local languages beyond the available translations.

55. Having in mind the general aims of the course and the different circumstances of the ports using the course, it has been difficult to match the training material to every local condition.

Instructors

56. The instructors have been considered as essential for successful training under IPP-1. They should be recruited from among those having practical experience, in particular traffic managers. The trainees' assessment of their instructors' performance has generally been positive, and priority would need to continue to be given to the training of instructors. The trainer's handbook has been considered to be useful in planning and delivering the course.

Training Environment

57. The environment surrounding training has been considered to be very important, including managerial activities favouring training, the linkage between training and the overall personnel policies of a port authority and the port environment in general which could affect the influence of training activities on cargo handling operations. However, in many ports training activities have had low priority and are regarded as an activity which interfered with production. In order to improve the situation, the training department of a port should have the highest status and its head should be a member of the executive board.

58. While, on the one hand, IPP-1 has been offered to and utilized by port authorities, the private stevedoring companies, on the other hand, have shown little interest in training in general. Consequently, a difference could be observed between these two types of organizations, which although interdependent show a growing disparity in terms of skills and awareness.

59. In the absence of improvements in the area of port infrastructure and equipment, the contribution of training to increased port performance cannot but be limited. In this regard, the lack of equipment and spare parts would constitute the major problem for ports in developing countries in the future.

Impact

60. The conclusion reached is that the course has met its objectives for the training of junior and middle level managers. It has strengthened the self-confidence of the participants. At the same time, the need for adapting the course to local conditions has been stressed. In some ports, particularly in Karachi and Mombasa, the IPP-1 course has had a high status and has been supported by the executive management. In cases where training has had clear

backing by top managers, it has been easy to identify measures taken in order to implement the new knowledge gained from the course, such as the IPP model section berth experiment in Mombasa.

61. The most obvious and interesting finding has been the greater awareness on the part of the people trained of the importance of their participation in the port industry. However, only a few trainees could agree that they were able to contribute to increased productivity. In most cases, lack of equipment or lack of support from superiors has been cited as the reason for lack of improvement in this area. However, it appears that most trainees have tried to apply their newly acquired knowledge, as reflected in an increased ability to understand stowage plans or their recognition of the need for better organization in the stowage areas.

62. As regards port users, they have provided only information of a general character and have acknowledged the existence of a better climate for their dealings with the port authorities.

Recommendations

63. The consultant has made three main recommendations:

(a) **The continuation of IPP-1 in a "modernized" form.** The present combination of self studies, discussions and tests is good and needs to be maintained. The inclusion of more practical exercises and of computer simulations is strongly advised, together with a simplification of the language of the English version and the updating of the audio-visual equipment. The content of the course may be complemented by the addition of modules on containerization, computerization, port safety, etc. As it will take time to develop a new version of IPP-1, it is recommended that the course in its present form continue to be delivered both in ports where it has already been applied and in other ports where it has not yet been run.

(b) **Development of two new courses following the IPP-1 model to be adapted to local conditions.** The first course, which will have as its target audience junior management staff and newly employed officers, will concentrate on communicating the message of the first part of the IPP-1 course. The focus will be on the achievement of good port performance. Its content would be more "pragmatic" and new modules (hazardous cargo treatment, port safety, etc.) may be added. A good model in this respect would be the course developed in Bombay ("Towards a well-run berth"). The second course should be more academic and designed for senior port managers. Computer simulations should also be included. The duration of this course should not exceed three or four days.

(c) **Development of other courses.** Apart from the modernization of the IPP-1 course, there is a need for other training programmes. The same methodology could be used for the development of other courses particularly for the training of senior management on some key issues. There should be a concentration on policy issues where training packages can be developed centrally by qualified consultants. Local delivery would not require any adaptation. This type of course should be supplemented by other programmes for lower level staff for which an adaptation of the course to local conditions would be required. It is therefore advisable to encourage ports in

developing countries to assess properly their training needs and to establish comprehensive training programmes to cover them.

64. In future deliveries of IPP-1, account will have to be taken of the existence of other courses such as IPP-2 (container terminal development policy) and IPP-3 (equipment management: policy, management and maintenance). The need to develop courses in other areas of interest (human resource development; computerization; time management, etc.) should also be considered.

65. In order to achieve sustainability in this area, local training institutions of developing countries should be capable of handling the major part of their training programme development. Permanent staff at the appropriate level should be assigned to these institutions on a full-time basis, with a status and career promotion prospects which will attract the best possible candidates. Furthermore, in order to cover the training needs of small ports, these training institutions should be responsible for the training of port staff on a regional basis. Co-operation between ports is desirable. At the same time, efforts should be made to provide training programmes for the training of the trainers and course developers, with assistance from training institutions in developed countries.

B.2. Other port projects

66. Apart from IPP, 20 specific projects in the ports field have been implemented. In addition, two interregional projects concerned with training and advisory services are continuing. The objectives and the results of the specific projects are summarized in the fact sheets in Annex I, Section A.

67. The 20 projects in this field, of a total value of $5,061,800, represent the most important component of the specific individual projects implemented by the Shipping Division, far exceeding such projects relating to shipping, multimodal transport, maritime legislation or multisectoral activities. The importance also reflects the "comparative advantage" of the Division and the immense need of developing countries for various kinds of assistance in the port field, including assistance relating to operational or institutional improvement, such as the installation or modernization of port equipment, the efficient operation of container terminals, and the improvement of port management structures and procedures through, inter alia, the introduction of improved systems concerning cost accounting, port tariffs, port statistics and performance indicators.

68. Several projects have achieved partial or incomplete results. Lack of sustained interest or lack of follow-up on the part of the Government concerned or non-assumption of responsibility on the part of the user organizations were contributing factors. For one particular project, an evaluation mission found that, while positive results had been achieved, the Shipping Division shared responsibility with all the other parties concerned for the lack of effectiveness of the project. In another case, delays in follow-up and various misunderstandings had led to inconclusive results.

69. However, the great majority of the completed projects were successfully implemented. Among them was one carried out for the port of Nampo in the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, in order to equip it with fully

mechanized facilities for the handling of bagged and bulk cement, which turned out to be particularly effective. The project had received strong, sustained local support and relied mostly on local resources which resulted in substantial savings in external costs.

Advisory service on ports

70. The Division had established in 1981, with the help of a donation from the Government of the Netherlands, an advisory service to assist Governments or port authorities in the implementation of UNCTAD research findings in the field of ports (INT/81/A03). Through this advisory service, a variety of problems have been tackled through short missions, with the help of short-term experts. When problems could not be solved in such a way, advice was given on possible assistance from other sources. The "trouble shooting" nature of the assistance characterized by a quick response rate has been found to be helpful in many instances and the service is appreciated by the authorities concerned. The Ad hoc Intergovernmental Group of Port Experts, which met in 1986, recommended that the service be continued.

UNCTAD/APEC Container Terminal Management Seminars

71. By means of a donation from the Government of Belgium, UNCTAD and Antwerp Port Engineering and Consulting (APEC) jointly established in 1981 a programme of seminars on container terminal management to train port managers from developing countries (INT/82/A05). The objective is to reduce the dependence of developing countries on the use of expatriates for the management and operation of container, roll-on/roll-off and multi-purpose terminals.

72. Starting in September 1981, one seminar has been held each year on the planning, management and operation of such terminals, alternatively in English and in French. A total of 194 senior officials from developing countries responsible for or in charge of such terminals have participated in the training programme. In 1985, the complete set of lecture notes was published as a manual to serve as a guide for future deliveries and as an aid to officials who cannot attend the seminar. The quality of the deliveries has benefited from past experience. However, further adaptation to the needs and problems of developing countries continues to be needed. No in-depth evaluation has been conducted to assess the effectiveness of the seminars, although end-of-course evaluations have been made routinely with positive assessments by the participants. An increasing number of applications has been received each year.

C. Shipping other than TRAINMAR

73. Four specific shipping projects in this group have been implemented, in addition to various projects relating to feasibility studies for ship acquisition. Further, a project combining a computerized shipping management simulation game with training is continuing. The four projects have been concerned with various aspects of operational, institutional and policy improvement in the shipping field. The objectives and results of the four projects are summarized in the fact sheets in Annex I, Section B.

Feasibility studies

74. An important component of the activities in this area is the programme of feasibility studies for ship acquisition established pursuant to Conference resolution 121 (V). Under this programme, the secretariat has placed expert advisers with specialist skills at the disposal of developing countries to assist in the preparation of feasibility studies. Since no universal formula exists, each study has to be tailor-made to suit the special circumstances of each shipping opportunity. The advice is intended to provide a technical, economic and commercial basis for an objective investment decision. When combined with sound judgement, commercial realities and the socio-economic environment, it provides an analytical framework within which the investment opportunities and risks can be assessed and quantified.

75. The number of studies which the Shipping Division can undertake is limited by financial considerations and by the backstopping capacity available. At present, an average of two studies is undertaken per year. The studies are financed largely by the requesting Government or organization and normally cost about $US 25,000 each (for a three- to four-month exercise). UNCTAD's substantive role is restricted to assisting in the preparation of feasibility studies and providing guidance and backstopping to the consultants who actually carry out the work, and, to the extent necessary, co-ordinating the work of counterparts. Such studies, which have a direct bearing on the development process, are financially competitive and benefit from the objective advice which the secretariat can provide.

76. During the period 1980-1988, the main studies conducted under the feasibility study programme included: four studies on the feasibility of establishing a national shipping line (for the Governments of Cyprus (1981), Suriname (1981), the Republic of Tanzania (1985) and Oman (1986); two studies on the feasibility of establishing a community shipping line for CEAO (1981) and of establishing a coastal shipping line for ECOWAS (1985); a study prepared together with IMO as associate agency on the improvement of inter-island services for the Government of Fiji (1981); a study on the feasibility of establishing a regional bulk fleet to service its grain trade, for CARICOM (1983); a study on the use of sail-assisted vessels to complement motor-driven vessels, as well as a study on domestic transport for the Government of the Republic of the Maldives (1984); and a study on the scope of co-operation among member States of OIC for optimizing shipping capacity utilization (1989). In addition, a number of pre-feasibility studies were carried out in connection with some of the feasibility studies mentioned above, as well as several other pre-feasibility studies on: a liner maritime transport link between West Africa and the River Plate for ECOWAS (1982); a coastal bulk service for ECOWAS (1983); and a passenger coastal service for ECOWAS (1983). Two studies are in progress: a study on the viability of establishing a West African passenger coastal ferry service for MINCONMAR; and a study on the restructuring of the West Indies Shipping Corporation for the Government of Trinidad and Tobago.

77. Generally such studies indicate the conditions to be met for obtaining the improvements sought or for establishing a viable shipping line or shipping service, as well as various alternative options to be followed until such conditions can be achieved. The completed studies have provided useful and objective information at a modest cost, compared to the expenditures involved

which could exceed $100 million in certain cases, and may have contributed directly to sound investment decisions, including avoidance of costly, non-viable investments.

STRATSHIP

78. The secretariat had established in 1988, with the help of a donation from the Government of Norway, a project designed to promote the use of modern management techniques in shipping companies (INT/88/A01). For this purpose, a computerized shipping management simulation game (STRATSHIP) is used, and two related courses have been developed. Specifically, the aim has been to develop two strategic planning training courses using the TRAINMAR methodology and utilizing STRATSHIP as a key element; arrange three deliveries in Asia, Africa and Latin America to train at least 20 senior executives; to identify and train local instructors; and to set up the course at three local TRAINMAR centres.

79. Four workshops have been held to date. Some 65 shipping executives and 6 out of the 8 identified instructors have been trained. The course material has been validated but is being refined with each delivery using feedback from the participants. The project has generated income of over $10,000 to co-finance the deliveries, with participants paying $200 each for attendance. The usefulness of the course is borne out not only by the number of placements requested but also by the willingness of shipping companies to finance trainee participation.

Registrar for the United Nations Convention on a Code of Conduct for Liner Conferences

80. The Registrar, appointed in 1985 in compliance with the provisions of the United Nations Convention on a Code of Conduct for Liner Conferences, undertakes functions relating to the settlement of disputes, as provided for in the Convention, and is also available to Governments for advice concerning legislative and other measures pertaining to the implementation of the Convention. Since his appointment, the Registrar has received numerous requests for assistance with regard to the implementation of the Convention both in general terms and in respect of specific provisions, as well as concerning matters related to the Review Conference. These requests have emanated from Governments, shippers' organizations, national shipping lines, liner shipping conferences, as well as regional and subregional organizations dealing with shipping matters, and have involved, inter alia, field missions, participation in meetings and the conduct of seminars and workshops.

D. Other activities

81. The other activities include 11 specific individual projects relating to (i) multimodal transport; (ii) maritime legislation; and (iii) multisectoral activities i.e. those covering within the same project shipping, ports, etc. The objectives and results of these projects are summarized in the fact sheets shown in Annex I, Section C. In addition, there are two training programmes and one programme for the distribution of software

programmes relating to multimodal transport operations. The activities of the Sectoral Support Adviser relating to maritime and multimodal transport are also included in this category.

82. This category includes a number of particularly successful projects, including a project for the establishment of an Information System for Ports and Maritime Transport in Cuba, a Shipping Data Processing Centre in the People's Republic of China, and a project for the Development of the Transport Sector in the Republic of Cameroon. An important common factor would seem to be a clear appreciation of the importance of the project and the willingness to back it up with strong local support, including local experts, which helped not only to reduce external costs but also to ensure that there was local expertise available to sustain the results of the project.

JOBMAR

83. After a preparatory assistance project (INT/85/006) which established that there was wide support and demand for institutionalized on-the-job training in the maritime sector, a programme for such training (JOBMAR) was implemented in August 1989 (INT/88/029), designed to transfer the latest management technology from advanced maritime nations to developing countries through the mechanism of on-the-job training.

84. The project is being implemented in co-operation with other members of the United Nations system, Governments and private sector maritime interests, including the Centre for Maritime Co-operation (CMC) of the International Chamber of Commerce. Particular attention is given to (i) cost-sharing with the private sector; (ii) the promotion of TCDC, particularly between the more advanced maritime nations (e.g. Singapore, Brazil, India, the Republic of Korea) and other developing countries; (iii) utilizing accumulated non-convertible currencies in the USSR/UNDP Trust Fund for training in State shipping companies; and (iv) facilitating the transfer of technology, involving, inter alia, secondments of senior maritime executives to developing countries under the Maritime Short Term Advisory Services and counterpart training. Requests received have so far surpassed placements.

Multimodal transport workshops

85. The secretariat established in 1984 a programme of workshops to promote the concept of multimodal transport. Specifically, it seeks to develop, according to TRAINMAR methodology, top-quality training material for deliveries in developing countries; to create local training capability and apprise transport officials of modern transport developments and techniques; and to explain the consequences of the implementation of relevant transport and customs conventions.

86. Thirty-four deliveries had been made by the end of 1989 with the participation of 821 officials. Local training capabilities are being developed, and the training material is constantly being updated. Of the 34 deliveries made, 16 have been financed by UNDP, 7 by bilateral donors, and 11 have been financed by local organizers, some of them charging fees to participants. In 20 cases, the participants have recommended the introduction of multimodal transport operations in their countries. Consequently, two Governments have introduced regulations for multimodal transport operations

and two others have ratified the Hamburg Rules. Requests for additional activities are arriving faster than they can be accommodated. Increasing emphasis will be placed in the future on local deliveries without external assistance, and on practical operational matters.

MULTISHIP

87. In 1986, the secretariat established a project designed to develop and disseminate the series of software programmes developed by UNCTAD under the common name of MULTISHIP (INT/86/A06). The programmes help shipping companies engaged in multimodal transport operations to make complex calculations of costs quickly and thus to supply quotations without undue delay.

88. Four programmes, unique to the software market, have been developed for international multimodal transport operations. Developed originally to run on large mainframe computers, they have now been converted to run on PCs which are within the financial reach of all companies. MULTISHIP Model II has reached a good level of sophistication and has been distributed to a total of 15 organizations. Many of them have continued to adapt the programmes to their own needs. The activities are self-financing and have also generated income to finance multimodal transport workshops. Continued adaptation is necessary in order to respond to users' needs which are continually being shaped by rapid technological developments.

Sectoral Support Adviser

89. The UNCTAD sectoral support advisory service in the field of maritime and multimodal transport, established under the UNDP Sectoral Support Programme, has been operational since 1979. Until the reorganization of the UNCTAD secretariat in 1988, the Adviser had devoted practically all his activities to that sector. Since then, the Adviser, in addition to his activities in that sector (estimated to account for about 60 per cent of his time), has also dealt with matters in other fields, including management policies, methods and techniques in relation to transit transport and trade facilitation as well as the introduction and use of computerized management systems in the areas of trade, customs procedures and debt management.

90. The advisory service is available on request and free of charge to Governments. Between 1979 and 1988, the activities of the advisory service have involved more than 100 missions covering about 60 countries and visits to more than 15 intergovernmental organizations. The activities in the maritime and multimodal transport sector have consisted essentially of providing on-the-spot advice and assistance on a wide range of topics (the greater part of the activities) and the identification of technical assistance requirements and follow-up, including, as appropriate, the preparation of draft project documents. In 1985, a summary of the activities for the period 1979-1984 was submitted for use in a UNDP-led evaluation of UNDP's Sectoral Support Advisory Services.

SHIPASSIST Directory

91. The SHIPASSIST Directory, updated periodically, provides information to developing countries on the availability of technical assistance in the field of maritime and multimodal transport from national organizations in both developed and developing countries, as well as from international organizations and institutions. An internal evaluation conducted in 1988 concluded that, as there was no effective demand for the service, the Directory should be discontinued so that resources might be released for other functions elsewhere in the secretariat. This lack of interest has been further confirmed. Consequently the Committee may wish to decide that the Directory be discontinued.

III. OVERALL ASSESSMENT, INCLUDING SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. General assessment

92. The most striking feature of the technical co-operation programme in the field of maritime and multimodal transport during the period under review is its size and variety. There is evidence of great energy and creativity in the constant search for innovative and better methods, whether it is to solve problems, to improve skills and knowledge, to transfer techniques or to disseminate information on the results of the Division's research activities. The development of computer software under MULTISHIP, a computer simulation game under STRATSHIP, the institutionalization of on-the-job training under JOBMAR, the development of a Manual on a Uniform System of Port Statistics and Performance Indicators, the various advisory services and the work initiated on mastery of the transport chain are all examples of this commendable effort. In addition, two major training programmes have been developed and implemented: IPP for ports and TRAINMAR for shipping, ports and multimodal transport. These have put UNCTAD's maritime training activities on the map, so to speak, by the scale and ambition of their activities. The record of achievements is indeed impressive.

Training activities

93. The Shipping Division has pioneered and implemented a wide range of training activities including:

(i) TRAINMAR, with about 50 per cent of the courses developed for port officials;

(ii) IPP, for port officials;

(iii) UNCTAD/APEC seminars on container terminal management, for port officials;

(iv) JOBMAR, providing on-the-job training in countries with a more advanced maritime sector, for shipping and port officials;

(v) STRATSHIP, strategic planning workshops involving a computerized shipping management simulation game and courses using the TRAINMAR methodology, for shipping officials;

(vi) multimodal transport workshops using the TRAINMAR methodology, for transport officials.

In addition, practically all the specific projects reviewed have included a training component including, among others, fellowships and study tours. This component is generally estimated to account for 10 to 20 per cent of the project budget.

94. Training will remain an important component of the technical co-operation programme whether as individual programmes or as part of project activities, even if international support for certain activities progressively declines as the established training institutions move towards self-sufficiency. In the period ahead, the activities will thus need to be further consolidated and, to

the extent necessary, rationalized so that they coalesce into a coherent programme to meet the needs of the 1990s. Particular attention will need to be given to TRAINMAR and IPP, since the areas of "overlap" have become fairly important. With the adoption of the recommendation made in the IPP evaluation concerning the development of local capacity for course development in the IPP programme as well, TRAINMAR and IPP would move even closer together. There is thus a need to ensure complementarity of the activities of the two programmes. In this regard, the objective of developing self-sufficient capacity for local course development and delivery needs to be pursued vigorously, at the level of both local centres and co-operating networks. Such local-course development activities should build on the experience of TRAINMAR and be generally related to more localized and less policy-oriented problems. At the same time, the shift of IPP towards central development of policy-oriented courses or seminars for policy makers highlights the complementary role which IPP can play in relation to TRAINMAR. In this regard, the training strategy for port equipment initiated by the Division (see para. 50) already combines TRAINMAR and IPP philosophies and courses and should be extended.

95. Vigorous efforts should be made to implement the action plan for TRAINMAR and the recommendations arising from the IPP evaluation as well as to achieve further co-ordination between TRAINMAR and IPP in order to enhance their complementarities. A major fund-raising effort will need to be mounted in order to secure the necessary resources for the further development and consolidation of the training programme towards self-sustainable development with minimum international support. The Division will also need to contribute to the formulation of policies relating to manpower planning, training and other aspects of human resources development in the relevant sectors, taking account of future needs and orientations, including the evolution towards the concept of more integrated transport systems. In this connection, attention will need to be given to updating the assessment of the training needs in the field of maritime and multimodal transport.

Other activities

96. The other activities may be grouped according to the following broad objectives:

(i) operational improvement involving the transfer and application of techniques, procedures, equipment and technologies;

(ii) institutional improvement, involving the creation, development or strengthening of institutions or institutional arrangements;

(iii) policy improvement, involving policy development, co-ordination or harmonization; and

(iv) provision of advisory services.

Many of the specific projects in the ports and shipping fields and all the multisectoral projects have combined more than one of the broad objectives.

97. The objectives and results of each of the specific individual projects are summarized in the fact sheets in Annex I. However, a number of general

conclusions may be drawn from an overall analysis of the projects in relation to the various broad objectives. First, the number of projects relating mainly to operational or institutional improvement far exceeds those dealing mainly with policy improvement. Secondly, those projects which have dealt mainly with operational or institutional improvement would seem to show more concrete results than those which have dealt mainly with less tangible matters like policy improvement. The reason is probably that a policy environment involves too many variables which are beyond the control of a project, as compared to a clear-cut operational situation. However, it does not necessarily follow that such policy-oriented projects have been less effective. Thirdly, while regional projects may appear to be less effective than national projects, no definite conclusions can be drawn without reference to their objectives and their overall or long-term significance.

B. Interaction of the programme with research activities

98. The technical co-operation programme in the field of maritime and multimodal transport has accounted on average for about 24 per cent of the total programme of UNCTAD. In value terms, its size has fluctuated broadly in line with the variations in the overall programme. It reached its peak at $3,863,000 (25.2 per cent of the total) in 1981, dropped to $1,771,000 (24.7 per cent) in 1985, and reached the level of $3,245,000 (26.6 per cent) in 1988. Not counting the Division's contribution to various transit corridor projects in Africa which started operations in 1988-1989, the Division's programme reached $3,612,000 (19.7 per cent) in 1989. However, the number of posts assigned to the Division, including vacancies, notwithstanding a slight decrease as a result of the retrenchment exercise in 1988-1989, has remained relatively stable.

99. Along with several others, the Shipping Division has consistently backstopped a proportionately larger volume of projects than other substantive programmes in UNCTAD. This situation raises a number of questions: What is the explanation for the larger volume of technical co-operation programme? Has the proportionately larger programme been helpful to the research work, and its interaction with technical co-operation activities? What improvements are needed in order to enhance the technical support function? Given a tight resource situation, will it be necessary to be more selective in the choice of projects, to the extent that a choice belongs to the secretariat? These questions are discussed briefly below.

100. A number of factors would seem to have contributed to the high volume of technical co-operation activities. One is obviously the "comparative advantage" of the Shipping Division in an area where the needs are immense, particularly relating to operational and institutional improvement. It is in fact in recognition of these needs that two major training programmes, TRAINMAR and IPP, have been developed, which have in themselves contributed to the sustained high volume of the programme. Another factor is that the Shipping Division has had a number of instruments, including various advisory services, to publicize its activities.

101. As regards the second question, it should be mentioned at the outset that, during the period 1984-1989, for example, the regular budget has budgeted about 28 per cent of the professional work months for substantive backstopping activities. Whether this corresponds to the actual resources

devoted to the support function is difficult to establish, since there is no systematic procedure for quantifying the amount of staff time devoted to it. However, a limit may have been reached in the sense that any further increase in such backstopping activities, without a matching increase in resources, may begin to affect the quality of work or to interfere seriously with the essential research function.

102. Nevertheless, the interaction between the research and technical co-operation activities arising from the high volume of the latter has been found to be positive and helpful. Examples of valuable inputs derived from technical co-operation activities and fed into the research work have been cited in the ports field, including port planning. Some of the projects have also provided useful practical experience relating to the implementation of the research work on port statistics and port pricing or on multimodal transport questions. The technical co-operation activities have also been helpful for the dissemination of information on international instruments negotiated under the auspices of UNCTAD. However, much greater use could probably have been made of feedback from technical co-operation activities, e.g. from the problem analyses associated with TRAINMAR, for the development of non-training solutions to common port problems in developing countries. At the same time, the TRAINMAR centres might have been used much more for the dissemination efforts of the Division regarding its work and the international maritime instruments adopted in UNCTAD.

103. The interaction between the research and technical co-operation activities is also important from the point of view of enhancing the technical support function. In a tight resource situation, the interaction between the research and technical co-operation activities, in particular the interaction between the research-cum-project officer and the consultant, may be seen as a potential source of external expertise that can help to enrich the in-house expertise for the technical support function. Such a source can be strengthened by making appropriate provisions for longer debriefing sessions with the consultant and for participation by the research-cum-project officer in important review exercises, including tripartite reviews, depending of course on the size and nature of the project. Such participation is particularly important in the case of longer term projects, involving longer-term consultancies, in order to enable the research-cum-project officers to have a better overview of the development and results of the projects, which is necessary for good project execution, and to interact on the spot with the consultants as well as with the authorities and the users. Such a source of external expertise can also be strengthened by enlarging as much as possible the base of that source and by avoiding excessive reliance on the same consultants over prolonged periods. It is thus important that every effort should be made to expand and diversify to the fullest extent possible the supply of external expertise from the use of consultants.

104. It would appear that the increased backstopping responsibilities of the Division may have led to a situation where much less resources have been devoted to technical support than to non-technical support. An increase in resources for backstopping will obviously help in enhancing the technical support function. On top of internal efforts by the Division, there is a need

to ensure that additional support costs generated by an increasing volume of technical co-operation activities are distributed to the fullest extent possible, consistent with the requirements of the central support function, among the Divisions and Programmes which have generated the increase and which sustain their programmes.

C. Guidelines for the selection of projects and priorities

105. The question has been raised as to whether the secretariat, within the available resources should be more selective in the choice of projects, assuming that such a choice belongs to the secretariat. If so, what guidelines should be used? While most of the projects reviewed have been in response to governmental or intergovernmental requests, a significant proportion of them have been initiated by the secretariat. The Division therefore has had some discretion in the choice of projects, and continues to exercise such discretion. Even in the case of the projects requested by Governments, the Division can advise and suggest and can therefore exercise some influence.

106. As the backstopping capacity is not totally elastic, within a given resource situation, some guidelines or criteria would seem necessary. Three criteria had already been suggested in document TD/B/C.4/325. For completeness, these are reproduced below:

- The relevance of the activity to the Division's mandate;
- Availability of staff with the necessary technical expertise to supervise effectively the project;
- Whether UNCTAD is the most competent body to execute the project.

107. Others may be added, as follows:

- The urgency or critical nature of the needs to be addressed;
- The usefulness of the project in relation to current or emerging needs of many other developing countries, and its potential application as a "model" project for other developing countries;
- The degree of local commitment to the project, including commitment of local resources and counterparts for project implementation and follow-up.

108. In the case of important training activities, some additional criteria may be specified, including:

- The size of training needs;
- The availability of training facilities;
- The training environment, including the availability of counterpart personnel.

109. The degree of local support should be viewed as an important contributing factor for the success of a project. Its significance should be seen in the context of the debate concerning the need to build up or strengthen local capacity with regard to attaining the objective of national execution of projects.

110. Such guidelines or criteria, which will obviously have to be applied with some imagination, may also help in case priorities have to be assigned between competing projects. For example, a project which is marginally relevant to UNCTAD's mandate and for the execution of which UNCTAD may not be the most competent body should obviously be ranked lowest, if it is to be undertaken at all. Conversely, a project which shows promise of sustainable results because of a clear intention by the Government or user organization to commit the necessary resources for implementation and follow-up would probably deserve a high priority rating. Likewise, a project which is intrinsically valuable in relation to current or emerging needs of many other developing countries and which can serve as a "model" for other developing countries would probably also qualify for high priority treatment.

111. In a tight resource situation, and to the extent that the Division has some discretion in the choice of projects, a good selection of projects, while responding to developing countries' needs, can help to ensure that projects are broadly in line with the Division's current and new areas of specialization, taking into account new and emerging developments to which the Division, in order to retain its "comparative advantage", will need to respond. It is important that the Division should apply some guidelines, as appropriate, so as to ensure a reasonable balance between its research and technical co-operation activities and to retain its areas of "comparative advantage".

D. Improvement of project design, implementation and follow-up

Performance indicators

112. Some basic performance indicators will need to be specified for projects in order to help monitor their progress and the extent to which the projects have achieved the expected results. Such indicators would also be useful for evaluation purposes. The analysis made of the technical co-operation programme for this evaluation points to the need for certain performance indicators including the following examples:

- Proportion of project objectives achieved;
- Number of people trained, systems installed, institutions established, etc. as a proportion of the target number;
- Cost per trainee/week for each category of trainees, by type of training programme;
- Popularity or quality of a course (number of adaptations/translations/rejections);
- Degree of self-financing of a project (i.e. proportion of the total cost met by participants, user organizations, co-operating organizations, etc.);

- Number of requests received, as compared to the target number or the available capacity;

- Degree of "sustainability" (e.g. level of activity of a training institution after external support is withdrawn; number of trainees still in the functions for which they have been trained, after a sufficient time lapse; ratio of local experts/counterparts to external experts during project implementation and follow-up, etc.).

113. It is recognized that there may be practical problems in terms of obtaining accurate and comprehensive information and in terms of measurability. But these problems are not insurmountable, and some "value judgment" may be needed in some cases. Some indicators, e.g. cost per trainee per week, are not particularly useful on their own, but may be quite useful when viewed over time (to see whether, for example, "economies of scale" are achieved) or when comparisons are made among types of trainees or programmes, provided that the basis for comparison is a sound one. It is also recognized that, in a tight resource situation, the specification and "quantification" of such indicators may give rise to complaints about additional workloads. However, such indicators should be introduced gradually, and regarded as helping to improve the formulation of projects, including the specification of project objectives, as well as feedback. It is recommended that the secretariat establish gradually some selected project performance indicators which may be included in the project monitoring system when established. Priority attention should be given to the early establishment of the latter in order to fill an important gap in terms of the lack of readily available information about project data, including performance and results, in any single source.

Improvement of dissemination and feedback

114. The Division has already instituted an ex post survey for multimodal transport workshops in order to obtain feedback on, inter alia, the assignments of past trainees and the use and effectiveness of the training which they have received. Provided that a good response rate is achieved, it provides an economical method for monitoring the impact and sustainability of training events. The Division is to be congratulated for this initiative as well as for its efforts to improve the dissemination of information about its activities by means of special mailing lists and the regular production of newsletters on TRAINMAR, ports and multimodal transport. The innovation made by the Shipping Division in the areas of dissemination and feedback should be extended not only within the Division but also to other parts of the UNCTAD secretariat.

Evaluation

115. The UNDP procedures for in-depth or independent evaluations provide for:

- Tripartite representation on evaluation missions, including a representative of the recipient Government or of the user organizations;

- The use in the evaluation of expertise from outside the "project management" area (i.e. other than those involved in the design, approval, implementation and management of a project);

- Responsibility for the conduct of the evaluation to be assigned to persons other than the project officers, who will act as resource persons.

To the extent that resources permit and, as appropriate, with the concurrence of the funding organizations, such procedures should also be applied to non-UNDP funded projects.

116. However, various lapses have been observed, including a case where a project officer headed the evaluation mission and several cases where the project officer assumed responsibility for the conduct of the evaluation. Such departures from established procedures could seriously detract from the independent nature of external evaluations. For this reason, it is important that the Division comply with the established UNDP procedures for in-depth evaluations.

117. In view of the important size of the training programme, it is particularly important that adequate attention be given to the ex post evaluation of training activities, in addition to end-of-course assessments routinely made by participants in practically all the training events organized by the Division. The problem is not one of lack of guidelines or procedures, but one of lack of application, due to either time or resource constraints. In this regard, two areas of improvement would seem valuable: (i) a regular operational review of training centres such as those associated with TRAINMAR; and (ii) a more systematic evaluation of post-training job assignments and performance, in order to assess the impact of training on job performance. In the latter connection, the procedure for an ex post survey of former participants at multimodal workshops may be extended. Combined with an operational review of the training centres, such a procedure can provide useful feedback for assessing the effectiveness of both the training centres and the courses provided.

E. National support and sustainability

118. The question of the importance of national policy and support has arisen in the context of the analysis of TRAINMAR and other training programmes, as well as in the analysis of specific individual projects. As regards the former, since TRAINMAR illustrates the problem very well, the discussion will draw on TRAINMAR's experience. TRAINMAR's objective - in terms of the development of local institutions and training capability, with emphasis on the development of local expertise to analyse deficiencies and to develop solutions through training courses, as well as the stress on achievement of financial and technical self-sufficiency over time - is a laudable one. In view of the importance of skills for the efficient management of the maritime industry, which will probably need to be updated periodically with the advent of new technology and practices, there is a need for a clear policy to give the necessary status to the training institution. It is equally important to provide appropriate inc ntives to the training personnel in order to achieve conditions of stability and sustainability. Discussion about the "cost-effectiveness" of developing local institutions and training capability, as compared to the use of external experts, will need to be viewed against this objective.

119. The cost of establishing the institution or developing the local training capability may be initially higher than the purchase of external expertise. However, it may still be worthwhile to create locally the institution and the capability since, once established, the capability can generate further outputs at little or no external cost. External expertise may still be required occasionally, to "top up" the acquired local expertise. However, that argument is only valid if conditions are created such that there is no undue wastage owing to a high turnover rate of trained staff. Otherwise, the objective of creating self-sufficiency will not be met. The issue of sustainability goes beyond maritime training. It embraces the whole area of human resources development, which is of fundamental importance for developing countries. In this connection, the success and stability achieved in the Academy in Abidjan may be cited, since the experience of the Academy may well serve as a possible model for other countries. It is recommended that developing countries which have established national training institutions and capacities, as part of their human resources development policies, with a view to achieving self-sustainable development over time, pay particular attention to the need to ensure stability of their training institutions and experts by according the right status to the training institutions and the necessary incentives to the training personnel.

120. The other common factor which has been observed in the analysis of training activities and specific individual projects is the importance of local support. Invariably where such support is forthcoming and sustained, and where local experts or counterparts are assigned as part of that support, the project is successfully implemented. This has been borne out in TRAINMAR projects where the ratio of counterparts to international experts has been as high as ten to one, as well as in some other types of projects. In such circumstances, local experts acquire expertise which is retained within the country, external costs are reduced and the local experts are available to help ensure follow-up and the sustainability of the results. It is important that developing countries commit adequate local support including, as appropriate, the attachment of local experts for project implementation and follow-up, in order to help ensure the success of the project and the sustainability of its results.

IV. INTER-AGENCY CO-OPERATION

121. Effective co-operation has been established with the regional commissions in the implementation of the TRAINMAR programme, as well as in the area of multimodal transport. There has also been effective co-operation with ITU and ICAO in relation to training methodology. ICAO has in fact adapted TRAINMAR in order to develop its own training programme (TRAINAIR). Good co-operation has also been established with the World Bank.

122. The UNDP/UNCTAD evaluation of TRAINMAR conducted in 1989 has indicated the need for better co-ordination at the higher level in order to ensure that those TRAINMAR centres co-operating with the World Maritime University (WMU) of the IMO or with ILO do not receive unco-ordinated advice. TRAINMAR may also form a basis for wider co-operation with ILO and IMO in the field of maritime training, although the prospect that their programmes may be seen as adjuncts to the UNCTAD programme may create difficulties. Whatever the solution chosen, it is hoped that the merits of the TRAINMAR approach will ensure its proper application. There is also scope for TRAINMAR to co-operate with non-maritime organizations such as ITC.

123. A joint working group of ILO, IMO and UNCTAD has been established to review the technical co-operation programme of the three organizations in the field of port training and to identify areas for increased collaboration and possible joint action. The group met for the first time in May 1989 when it agreed that closer working arrangements between the three organizations would be desirable not only from the point of view of the organizations themselves, but also for the developing countries and donors. It was agreed that technology shifts over the last two decades had made it necessary for the three organizations to avoid "compartmentalization" of their assistance and to work more closely in responding to the training and other needs of developing countries in all aspects of port management and operations.

124. A Joint Inspection Unit (JIU) report issued in March 1989 contained an evaluative assessment of the technical co-operation activities of IMO in the field of maritime training. It has recommended that ILO, IMO and UNCTAD establish an inter-agency steering committee to promote better co-ordination and exchange of information among them with regard to their maritime training programmes. This recommendation has been welcomed, and may well be accommodated by enlarging the terms of reference of the Joint Working Group. Some specific proposals for joint projects with both ILO and IMO are under consideration. There is also scope for joint activities with these organizations with regard to work on the harmonization of maritime legislation.

125. UNCTAD should continue to work with IMO and ILO, as well as with other international bodies, including the regional commissions, in order to strengthen inter-agency co-operation, including the undertaking of joint activities.

Notes

1/ External inputs for this assessment include: (i) a UNDP-financed external evaluation, conducted in 1988 by Messrs. S. Yafai (DPR Yemen) and M. Goucha (Tunisia) for the Arab region; (ii) another UNDP-financed external evaluation, conducted in 1989 by Messrs. B. Thomas (U.K.) and P. Bauchet (France) for the interregional project and the Asian and African regions, which led to a UNDP/UNCTAD report summarizing the main conclusions of that evaluation; and (iii) the responses received from the TRAINMAR centres in the context of an operational review conducted in 1989 (14 replies from 23 centres contacted).

2/ Based on a joint UNCTAD/SIDA in-depth evaluation of IPP-1 conducted in 1989 by Mr. Nicolas du Rietz (Sweden). The evaluation was confined to IPP-1, as IPP-2 has only been applied recently and IPP-3 and IPP-4 are still under development.

UNITED
NATIONS

TD

United Nations Conference
on Trade and Development

Distr.
GENERAL

TD/B/C.4/331/Add.1
19 April 1990

Original: ENGLISH

TRADE AND DEVELOPMENT BOARD
Committee on Shipping
Fourteenth session
Geneva, 21 June 1990

EVALUATION OF THE TECHNICAL CO-OPERATION PROGRAMME IN THE FIELD OF MARITIME AND MULTIMODAL TRANSPORT

Report by the UNCTAD ssecretariat

Addendum

ANNEXES

CONTENTS

Annex		Page
I.	Summary fact sheets of projects	2
II.	List of projects backstopped by the Division during the period 1980-1988	23
III.	List of TRAINMAR courses	28

GE.90-51104/1849B

ANNEX I

Summary fact sheets of individual projects and activities

A. Ports

PHI/77/012 - Development of Manila International Container Terminal (Philippines)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $604,700
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1980/1986
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Secretariat initiative
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Terminal evaluation, December 1985

(i) Nature/objectives:

The project sought to help the Philippines Ports Authority (PPA) develop its management capabilities and procedures for the efficient operation of the newly constructed Manila International Container Terminal.

(ii) Summary of results:

Training was provided for port supervisory personnel. A comprehensive manual on port management and operations was prepared, and a Users' Committee established to co-ordinate its implementation. Thus the management structure, operating procedures, information flows, customs procedures and maintenance techniques were improved.

The terminal evaluation concluded that the project had achieved its immediate objective but for a smaller scale of operation due to delays in terminal development.

TUR/78/012 - Port Management and Operations Training (Turkey)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $108,300
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1980/1983
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: ILO-executed project
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Terminal report 1983

(i) Nature/objectives:

At the request of ILO and with the support of the World Bank, UNCTAD participated as associate agency in an UNDP/ILO project designed to train port operations staff.

(ii) Summary of results:

Around 100 senior and middle-level port managers attended three seminars on port planning and port operations, which allowed them not only to become acquainted with modern management techniques but also to discuss common problems and to exchange experiences.

The terminal report concluded that the seminars had been effective and useful.

DKR/79/001 - Development of Port Facilities (Democratic People's Republic of Korea)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $2,118,900
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1980/1984
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Ex post evaluation, January 1986

(i) Nature/objectives:

The immediate objective was to equip the port of Nampo with fully mechanized facilities for the handling of bagged and bulk cement and to train local engineers to operate and maintain such facilities. By extending the experience to other ports in the country, the project would contribute to increasing the capacity of the nation's seaports for the handling of cement for export.

(ii) Summary of results:

Three fully mechanized bag loaders and one facility for bulk loading were installed. On-the-job training for local engineers was arranged as well as an overseas study tour for four officials to four countries. The mechanization has succeeded in improving the productivity of bag loading facilities in the Port of Nampo while that of bulk loading has resulted in a fivefold productivity increase. By using mostly local resources, the total cost of all the installations has been far less than the price of one entire plant purchased from abroad.

An in-depth ex post evaluation concluded that the project had been most effective, and the most successful one carried out in the Democratic People's Republic of Korea.

RAF/80/023 - Assistance for Modernization of Port Statistics and Introduction of Performance Indicators in Eastern and Southern Africa (Eastern and Southern Africa)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $158,000
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1981/1984
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Secretariat initiative
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Terminal report, October 1984

(i) Nature/objectives:

Following the development and application of a Manual on a Uniform System of Port Statistics and Performance Indicators for West and Central Africa (RAF/78/011), it was decided to implement a similar scheme for East and Southern Africa in collaboration with the Port Management Association of Eastern and Southern Africa (PMAESA) and ECA. The project was designed to meet the need for efficient statistical systems and performance indicators in order to manage cargo-flows and to monitor and improve port productivity.

(ii) Summary of results:

An adapted version of the Manual was developed, and a seminar was organized to train 36 selected officials in the implementation of the scheme. The scheme was fully implemented in 4, and partially implemented in 3, of the 11 participating ports. Further, two of the officials trained are now serving as UNCTAD technical assistance experts.

The terminal report found that, although the project had benefited from the West African experience, the results achieved had been rather disappointing due to a number of factors: lack of responsibility of port authorities for cargo handling in some countries; lack of awareness of the importance of accurate statistical information; and a reduction in UNDP support from 15 w/m to 8 w/m due to its own financial difficulties then.

ROM/80/001 - Port management training (Romania)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $14,800
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1980/1984
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Secretariat initiative
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objective was to provide training in order to prepare port management and supervisory staff for the efficient expansion of the country's ports, with emphasis on the planning and organization of modern cargo terminals. Efforts would also be made to develop local training capabilities.

(ii) Summary of results:

Two officials underwent two months of practical training at the Port of Antwerp (Belgium). A regular UNCTAD staff member undertook a consultancy mission to analyse port productivity together with a team of local middle managers who received training in the process through lectures, discussions and practical work in the port. Various training materials (audio-visual equipment, publications, etc.) were also provided.

OMA/81/014 - Development of Ports (Oman)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $18,400
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1983/1984
FUNDING SOURCE: Government of Oman
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: None

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objective was to advise the Government on the marketing of the Port of Mina Raysut, which was not being fully utilized and losing its competitiveness vis-à-vis other neighbouring ports, and to train a nucleus of staff in port planning and operations.

(ii) Summary of results:

A study was conducted on the Port of Mina Raysut in order to evaluate its capacity, the potential for attracting ships for regional trans-shipment and the feasibility of developing special economic zones to attract entrepot trade as well as processing and manufacturing activities.

One of the recommendations made, namely an overseas study tour for senior officials of the Ministry of Communications, was implemented, with the dispatch of three officials to several European ports. No information on the implementation of the other recommendations has been received.

MEX/82/A02 - Seminar on port management (Mexico)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $69,700
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1982
FUNDING SOURCE: Government
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

At the request of the Mexican Government, a two-week seminar was organized for Mexican port officials in order to update their knowledge of the latest port technology, as well as to avail them of an opportunity to meet with foreign specialists.

(ii) Summary of results:

Thirty-three port managers and officials attended the seminar, which consisted of lectures, case studies, exercises, film and slide shows and round-table discussions. Twelve international and national experts were invited to lecture on a wide range of topics. An evaluation questionnaire was completed by the participants after the seminar. High ratings were given for course content and presentation, and suggestions for further improvement were made.

CYP/83/001 - Limassol port container terminal (Cyprus)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $10,500
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1983/1984
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF + Government
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objectives were to determine the optimum equipment configuration needed for the handling and storage of containers at Limassol Port, in the context of the Government's intention to establish the port as a trans-shipment centre in the eastern Mediterranean and taking into account the current and expected volume of container traffic and trends in this type of shipping, as well as to advise on the required institutional arrangements for the most efficient operation of the container terminal.

(ii) Summary of results:

A consultant on container terminal equipment undertook a study and submitted recommendations on alternative types of equipment needed, depending on whether the port was to be developed into a major or minor trans-shipment centre. He also proposed that an entity be established with responsibility for operating the terminal.

EQG/83/006 - Assistance to Maritime Transport and Creation of Port Authority (Equatorial Guinea)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $236,900
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1983/1988
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: None

(i) Nature/objectives:

The project, a follow-up to project EQG/80/018, was designed to contribute to the improvement of port efficiency and consisted of activities to improve the management structure, operational procedures and the performance of the technical personnel through training.

(ii) Summary of results:

A new organizational structure for the Port Authority was established. The recommendation to introduce the UNCTAD Manual on a Uniform System of Port Statistics and Performance Indicators was accepted and led to various improvements. Various studies - on budget and accounting systems for port assets, national port security regulations and port infrastructure among others - were made.

Training of local technical personnel in some areas was carried out, but not to the extent needed. Several delays, the unavailability of an international expert and various misunderstandings with the Government led to the early termination of the project in 1988, which rendered the project less effective than it otherwise would have been.

MAT/83/002 - Marssaxlokk Container Terminal (Malta)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $95,300
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1986/1988
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Terminal report, November 1988

(i) Nature/objectives:

The aim of the project was to help establish efficient, self-sustaining management and operational systems at the new container terminal as well as a marketing activity to attract trans-shipment traffic.

(ii) Summary of results:

The project provided a number of limited inputs for the functioning of the container terminal, which were unfortunately not matched by timely or appropriate local inputs in terms of staff and equipment. Subsequent to the decision taken by the Government in January 1988 to establish a joint venture with a private foreign company to manage and operate the terminal, the project was terminated at the request of the Government.

The final report concluded that despite the limited inputs, the project had allowed the terminal to start operating.

DJI/84/005 - Assistance au ports (Djibouti)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $322,200
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1985/1989
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Ex post evaluation, January 1989

(i) Nature/objectives:

The project sought to develop national self-sufficient capacity to take over the operation of the new container terminal from its foreign operators through the development and implementation of appropriate procedures and regulations as well as training of local staff.

(ii) Summary of results:

Owing to various factors, including inadequate reporting procedures and difficulties associated with the international experts, the project achieved limited results. It helped the Port Authority to take over the operation of the container terminal which has been operational without external assistance since 1986. A base for tariff calculations was established, and regulations for the container terminal as well as revised general port regulations were drafted. Training has been provided to the local staff, albeit not to the extent needed.

An ex post in-depth evaluation concluded that the project was not cost-effective and that all the parties concerned were equally at fault.

STP/84/001 (next RAF/85/024) - Mechanisation et gestion du port (Sao Tome and Principe)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $121,300
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1986/1987
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

The project was aimed at revitalizing and overhauling the Port of Sao Tome, the only port handling the country's foreign trade, by implementing measures to raise the port's productivity and by providing it with appropriate equipment.

(ii) Summary of results:

With the help of an international expert posted on-site, the project provided land-based spare parts and cargo handling equipment to keep the port operational, devised a port organizational structure to allow for the efficient use of mechanization, developed tariff and statistical systems and provided training for managers. The project led to increased productivity, helped to prevent a threatened breakdown of the port and laid the groundwork for a follow-up project (RAF/85/024) designed to purchase the required floating equipment and to establish a national port authority.

MAR/85/003 - Assistance to Economic and Social Development (Mauritius)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $66,300
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1986/1989
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: None

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objectives were to improve port management as part of the country's Structural Adjustment Programme through improvement of the port organizational structure, identification of manpower requirements and appropriate training programmes, simplification of port charges and review of the incentive schemes.

(ii) Summary of results:

An international expert conducted two missions to the country, and submitted his findings and recommendations to the Government and other bodies concerned on the various aspects mentioned above. Among others, the report concluded that improved supervision, with the help of training, was more important for increasing productivity than incentive schemes. This project, which was part of a larger UNDP project, achieved the assigned tasks.

PAN/85/002 - Capacitación en la Esfera de Puertos y Transporte Marítimo
Port operations in Cristobal (Panama)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $169,500
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1986/1988
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP+IBRD country loan
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Terminal evaluation, December 1988

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objective of the UNDP/ILO project was to strengthen national training capabilities for all levels of personnel so as to improve the functioning of national ports and maritime services. UNCTAD participated as associate agency in order to prepare and deliver courses on cargo handling for middle-level managers. Its activities were later enlarged to include technical assistance in port planning and marketing.

(ii) Summary of results:

The number of workers trained exceeded expectations. However, the target for trained instructors was only partially reached (50 per cent). In order to enhance application of the skills acquired by the trainees, the project was extended to the administration of ports. The capability of the work force has been upgraded, and training has been institutionalized. UNCTAD courses complemented those of the ILO. UNCTAD provided support to the planning and marketing activities of the Autoridad Portuaria Nacional (APN) and identified new technological needs.

An evaluation conducted in 1988 concluded that the objectives of the project had been achieved.

GHA/86/A03 - Port Operational Statistics Workshop (Ghana)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $8,000
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1986
FUNDING SOURCE: Government
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objectives were to train personnel of the Ghana Ports Authority (GPA) to implement and operate UNCTAD's Uniform System of Port Statistics and Performance Indicators, as well as to train senior statisticians to run subsequent seminars.

(ii) Summary of results:

Thirty-five officials from three port organizations were trained in a one-week course. UNCTAD's Manual was used as course material and a series of exercises were worked out in order to give the participants practice in completing the necessary forms. The participants acquired a working understanding of the system and were able to undertake the tasks required. Further, a number of participants were identified as potential instructors and as "focal points" for the implementation of the system. An instructor from the Institute for Statistical, Social and Economic Research, University of Ghana, attended the workshop as an observer and later delivered a second course using the UNCTAD Manual.

KUW/86/004 - Advisory Assistance to Public Ports Authority (PPA) (Kuwait)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $16,900
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1989/1989
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Terminal evaluation, April 1989

(i) Nature/objectives:

The project was aimed at enhancing the administrative and operational efficiency of the PPA through improved management techniques and better operational procedures thus contributing to reduced costs and improved competitiveness, including tariff reductions.

(ii) Summary of results:

This is the first and preparatory phase of a larger project. A consultant, after having conducted a preliminary study, has presented a report and has recommended a programme of technical co-operation activities. The report is being studied by the Government.

RAF/87/123 - Tariff structures and cost accounting systems (West and Central Africa)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $420,400
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1988/-
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: IGO-PMAWCA
STATUS OF PROJECT: Ongoing
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

The project seeks to develop a harmonized port tariff structure which is simple and which also, through a cost accounting system, properly reflects the port's capital and operational costs. It endeavours in the first instance to develop a simplified and harmonized port tariff structure, and to implement a cost accounting scheme in three or four pilot projects of the region.

(ii) Summary of results:

The project has been implemented in collaboration with the Port Management Association of West and Central Africa (PMAWCA). Despite an initial delay, a harmonized tariff structure has been developed and accepted by all members of the PMAWCA. Four pilot ports were chosen to implement a cost accounting system; six other ports have requested assistance for the same purpose.

A computer model developed by the World Bank is available for studying the impact of the new tariff structure. Further, a cost accounting system has been devised based on a previous UNDP/UNCTAD project in Abidjan. The time and effort to implement the cost accounting system was under-estimated as it was a major change for the port authorities and required some reorganization and training, the benefits of which had to be accepted. The project is continuing.

BAR/88/004 - Container Terminal Development Seminar (Barbados)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $21,200
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1988/1988
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Secretariat initiative
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Terminal report, November 1988

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objectives were to improve co-ordination in the transport sector and to ensure that investments in specialized cargo-handling facilities were backed by sound organizational and institutional decisions.

(ii) Summary of results:

Sixteen participants from the various parties concerned attended a seminar on Container Terminal Development Policy (IPP-2). The seminar helped to enhance knowledge and skills and to improve communications, and also led to concrete steps being taken to improve the efficiency of container-handling operations, and to resolve the difficulties confronting the Port of Bridgetown, including manning level problems.

The terminal report concluded that the project had achieved its objectives.

B. Shipping

CAR/80/004 and RLA/79/051 - Regional co-operation in the development of shipping, including support for small vessels and schooners (the Caribbean region)

PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $846,000
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1980/1983
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Request of regional Governments
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Terminal report, December 1983

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objectives were to: define alternative policy guidelines for the development of maritime transport; establish a maritime information system; assist in the development of commercial shipping services; propose a financial scheme for the upgrading of small vessels, leading to safer voyages and reduced insurance premiums; help countries establish competent maritime safety administrations; and identify the type of repair facilities and marine works required to support the regional maritime sector.

(ii) Summary of results:

The project, named UNSHIPRO, was carried out under the direction of a Steering Committee composed of regional institutions (CARICOM, ECLAC, Caribbean Development Bank (CDB), Organization of Eastern Caribbean States (OECS)), IMO, UNDP and UNCTAD. Five resident experts, two United Nations volunteers and one regional counterpart were assigned to the project headquarters in Castries, St. Lucia, for varying periods, and administrative support was provided by the host Government.

A number of documents were prepared, notably six papers dealing with maritime policy and programmes in the Caribbean. A recommendation was made for the establishment of a Caribbean Maritime Centre within the CARICOM Secretariat but this was not followed through. However, a maritime cargo information system was established in OECS with the collaboration of the United Nations Statistical Office; Interim Statistical Reports (Volumes I and II) on regional shipping statistics were published. Further, advice was given to Governments on the

implications of international maritime conventions, support was given to shippers' councils on freight negotiations with shipping conferences, and a number of other ad hoc activities were undertaken. Finally, some of the original objectives had to be abandoned or changed because of resource constraints and shifts in priorities decided by the Steering Committee at the end of 1982.

BEN/80/001 - Assistance à la Compagnie Béninoise d'Armement Maritime (COBENAM) (Benin)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $117,400
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1984/1986
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: COBENAM/Government
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: None

(i) Nature/objectives:

The project concentrated on three areas of COBENAM's management: the establishment of a complete system for the financial evaluation and control of its maritime operations based on an analytical accounting system; the development of a container marketing plan in order to sell containerized services and to expand into new routes; and the establishment of a vessel maintenance programme in order to maximize fleet productivity.

(ii) Summary of results:

Owing to various delays, the project did not start until 1984, some four years after its original commencement date. Once started, COBENAM's management requested that the major emphasis be put on the establishment of a computerized accounting system. The marketing plan was limited to a one-month effort because the plan for container expansion was dropped. Further, the vessel maintenance programme was eliminated because a joint venture was established with another developing country which undertook this activity.

Although a report was prepared on a marketing plan for the container service, the project succeeded only in establishing a computerized accounting system, which is now operational.

MAR/81/003 - Establishment of a Freight Study Unit (Mauritius)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $51,700
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1983/1986
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: None

(i) Nature/objectives:

Following recommendations made by the Sectoral Support Adviser, the project was established to assist the Government of Mauritius in establishing a Freight Study Unit (FSU) within the Ministry of Industry and Commerce,

as well as with the implementation of a comprehensive system for the collection, tabulation and analysis of shipping statistics and freight rates, and the training of appropriate staff.

(ii) Summary of results:

The FSU is now fully operational. Assistance has also been provided for the design of a comprehensive system of shipping statistics, and for the training of staff for its operation. The staff of the FSU has also been trained in procedures for the monitoring and negotiation of freight rates, and guidelines developed for strengthening the Unit's freight rate negotiating capacity.

While further training of some officers of the Unit may still be needed, the project has achieved its overall objectives.

RAF/87/072 - Strengthening Intergovernmental Standing Committee on Shipping (ISCOS) (Eastern Africa)

PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $312,000
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1988/1990
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Ongoing
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objectives are to improve ISCOS' capability in consultations with shipowners and to create a subregional shipping statistics and information centre. In addition, it seeks to develop the capability of countries of the subregion to formulate sound shipping policies and to increase co-operation among them in the area of shipping.

(ii) Summary of results:

The shipping statistics and information to be collected have been identified together with their sources. Computer equipment to be used in the development of a shipping data base has been purchased and the necessary software developed. ISCOS staff have been trained to use the system. Actual collection of data has been delayed by ongoing changes being introduced in port statistics at the port of Mombasa. A questionnaire relating to the formation of national shippers' councils has been distributed to member countries and responses have been received. A specialist is to be recruited soon in order to assist in their establishment.

RAF/87/135 - Shipping Policy for Land-locked Countries (Africa)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $393,700
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1987/-
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Secretariat initiative
STATUS OF PROJECT: Ongoing
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

As part of a larger effort to improve the transit transport system, the project seeks to help the African land-locked countries to formulate a coherent shipping policy in the context of a general transport policy as well as to create or strengthen the necessary institutions for its implementation.

(ii) Summary of results:

An international expert has visited Niger, Swaziland, Zambia and Zimbabwe and has drafted a work plan of priority activities. Organizational guidelines for the establishment of shippers' councils have also been formulated. A consultant has concluded that the narrow cargo base would not justify the establishment of national shipping lines for land-locked countries, and has recommended that consideration be given to space/slot charter arrangements. The feasibility of establishing a national maritime transport company is being considered for Niger and the Central African Republic. Current activities concentrate on the protection of shippers' interests and the creation of corresponding institutions in Niger, Rwanda and Swaziland.

Due to lack of funds, the project has had to concentrate on requests for short-term assistance rather than for longer-term inputs.

The project is continuing in close collaboration with: the Ministerial Conference of West and Central African States on Maritime Transport (MINCOMAR), the Southern African Development Co-ordination Conference (SADCC), the Intergovernmental Standing Committee on Shipping (ISCOS) and the Preferential Trade Area for Eastern and Southern African States (PTA).

C. Others

CUB/76/001 - Information System for Ports and Maritime Transport (Cuba)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $1,956,000
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1977/1984
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Ex post evaluation, October 1984

(i) Nature/objectives:

The project sought to improve information systems by the establishment of a computer centre at the Ministry of Transport, the training of managers, analysts, programmers and operators, the development of regional computer

centres and the development of applications for maritime, road and rail transport. The overall objective was to improve the flow of cargo by reducing delays in the transport of goods between foreign ports and local receiving centres.

(ii) Summary of results:

The project received strong support from the Ministry of Transport, in cash and in kind. Five of the seven planned regional computing centres, in addition to the centre at the Ministry of Transport, were established. A mainframe computer system and ancillary equipment were purchased for the centre in Havana. A total of 47 applications were developed and implemented, and some of them rapidly contributed to improvements in cargo flow. Some 142 officers ranging from directors to computer operators have been trained to manage and operate the centres, as well as to develop applications.

The ex post evaluation found that the major problem was maintenance of computer equipment; the project had achieved its objectives, nevertheless. Cost-benefit estimates show that the initial investment had been fully recovered by the end of the project and benefits will continue to accrue in the future.

CKI/79/001 - Improvement of Inter-island and Feeder Transport Services (Cook Islands)

PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $161,200
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1979/1982
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objectives were to help develop a short- and long-term maritime policy and plan, and to provide assistance to the Government in implementing a comprehensive transportation network for the expansion of agricultural exports from the Cook Islands.

(ii) Summary of results:

An adviser on commercial shipping identified shipping legislation as a prerequisite to achieving the Government's shipping objectives. The adviser recommended that Cook Islands develop a national shipping line with vessels registered nationally so that the country could reduce freight bills and free itself from New Zealand labour union demands, which had been a factor contributing to the unprofitability of the existing shipping line. In addition, the adviser proposed the installation of a container system to replace the existing break bulk system; this would bring about a low cost/service ratio and reduce damage to agricultural exports. He also proposed various options for the improvement and development of the entire shipping system.

Work on Cook Islands' maritime legislation was undertaken then discontinued. A study on exports of fresh horticultural products by air was done by an export marketing adviser.

Three fellowships were awarded for the training of personnel in port administration.

MAG/79/017 - Amélioration de la desserte maritime (Madagascar)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $159,200
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1980/1984
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objectives were: to establish a Freight Study Unit at the Ministry of Transport (later changed to Shippers' Council) in order to assist the Government in developing its policies and in negotiating with Conferences; to carry out a study on the causes of port congestion and to find ways to reduce it; and to define and implement a port tariff structure.

(ii) Summary of results:

Studies were undertaken on: national shipping policy guidelines, with special attention given to the protection of shippers' interests; port statistics and tariff structure (which was later implemented in a pilot port); and a system for the collection and analysis of shipping data, with emphasis given to the training of local personnel. Consequently, two officials were trained in maritime economics in France. At the request of the Ministry of Finance, an exchange rate study was also undertaken.

The project achieved most of its objectives. The study on port congestion was dropped when the cause of congestion was identified as inadequate inland transport lines rather than port problems.

SUR/79/A08 - Support for transport policy and planning (Suriname)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $241,600
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1979/1981
FUNDING SOURCE: Netherlands
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Terminal report, February 1982

(i) Nature/objectives:

The main objective was to assist the Government of Suriname in managing its transport sector efficiently in support of its economic development. The activities focused on: elaboration of a transport policy; establishment of a transport advisory group; and the establishment of three modal transport commissions. The training of counterparts in both the public and private sectors in the analysis of economic developments and of operational performance formed part of this aim.

(ii) Summary of results:

An adviser on transport economics undertook various missions, submitted several policy papers and participated in a ship acquisition feasibility study for the Government. A strategy was devised to create greater awareness in the transport sector of the importance of policy development, co-ordination and planning. A Transport Advisory Group was established in the Ministry of Economic Affairs as planned; and a River-crossings Commission was established which effectively handled two major projects. However, only a few counterparts were trained, partly because of unsuitable academic background.

Despite various delays, the project achieved most of its objectives. Concrete and long-term results have been especially evident in civil aviation and shipping.

CPR/80/067 - Shipping Data Processing Centre (People's Republic of China)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $206,900
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1981/1985
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Ex post evaluation, February 1986

(i) Nature/objectives:

The aim of the project was to assist the Government in making the shipping data processing centre at the Shanghai Ship and Shipping Research Institute (SSSRI) fully operational. SSSRI activities focused on: the establishment of shipping file systems to provide inquiry services on vessel movements and port information; the development of applications including those relating to fuel analysis and statistics of passenger/cargo ships on domestic routes. The project provided some of the funds for the purchase of a larger mainframe computer system at the Centre and for upgrading the skills of the technical personnel in data processing through limited international expertise.

(ii) Summary of results:

The Government considered the project to be a national development priority, and provided strong support, both in cash and in kind. Despite some initial delays, including a delay in the installation of the basic equipment, all planned outputs, with the exception of two remote terminals awaiting installation because of delays with obtaining an export licence, had been achieved at the end of the project. Twenty-seven applications were developed, four times greater than the number originally envisaged. One of the most successful systems developed saves time and manpower for the salary calculations of 1,000 - 2,000 workers. As a by-product, it also produces basic operational statistics for the loading and discharging of vessels. Training and fellowships were also provided. The successful establishment of the Centre was a first step towards larger-scale implementation of computers into port and shipping management in China.

The ex post in-depth evaluation concluded that the project was successfully implemented. However, the national project stated that more inputs of international expertise would have resulted in faster and wider achievement of project outputs.

RAF/81/042 - Assistance to the Ministerial Conference of West and Central African States on Maritime Transport (MINCONMAR) (West and Central Africa)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $136,000
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1982/1988
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Secretariat initiative
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

The project sought: to assist MINCONMAR members to increase their maritime transport benefits by increasing the participation of their national shipping lines in both liner and bulk trades; to help the Regional Negotiating Committee on Freight Rates (RNC) to improve not only their technical capability, including compilation and analysis of regional freight and shipping data, but also their negotiating skills; to examine related areas of subregional concern, including the problems of land-locked countries, harmonization of national maritime laws, ports and marine insurance, and development of subregional and national shipping lines.

(ii) Summary of results:

A methodology for collecting and processing data was elaborated and counterparts were trained. Assistance was provided during successful negotiations with the European Conferences. However, the project duration was not sufficient to institutionalize a proposed Shipping Investigation Unit, as an extension was requested but not forthcoming.

Various studies were carried out on: the legislative and regulatory laws of member countries; the harmonization of cargo sharing schemes; the feasibility of establishing a Solidarity, Guarantee and Investment Fund and a Maritime Fund; analysis of bulk transport, insurance schemes and assistance to member land-locked countries. Little was achieved in the harmonization of national laws; follow-up generally suffered owing to lack of funds. However, two follow-up projects were formulated to improve maritime legislation (RAF/87/034 and RAF/87/123).

This regional project was particularly welcomed for providing South-South co-operation. However, due to lack of time and funds, the first positive results obtained were not consolidated or institutionalized.

IVC/82/004 - Etudes, organisation et gestion maritime et portuaire (Côte d'Ivoire)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $855,900
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1983/1989
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF and Government
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Secretariat initiative
STATUS OF PROJECT: Ongoing
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

As part of the overall national development programme, the project sought to contribute to the successful execution of the country's pilot maritime policy through the effective functioning of the Maritime Studies, Research and Documentation Institute (IDREM) as the "nerve centre" for policy direction. In addition, specific technical advice was requested by the operational entities of the sector (Ports of Abidjan and San Pedro, Shippers' Council). The project specifically concentrated on helping officials to undertake various types of study and research needed for the formulation of maritime policy while promoting the necessary interactions among all the sectors concerned for the implementation of a coherent and integrated maritime policy through the establishment of computerized systems, data banks, port accounting and statistical systems.

(ii) Summary of results:

Various port activities were carried out, including the installation of a port accounting system, a cost control system, the computerization of port administration, maintenance of port equipment, etc. The Port of Abidjan is presently considered as one of the more advanced and efficient ports of the subregion. The accounting system established by IVC/87/004 has been utilized as a model for other ports through project RAF/87/123. Several counterparts of IDREM were trained, and some basic studies were carried out. An evaluation conducted in October 1986, while acknowledging IDREM's contribution to research, proposed certain changes in order to strengthen the management and its research activities, as well as to place the Institute on a more secure and independent financial footing and to attract and retain high calibre staff.

RWA/86/005 - Assistance à la planification des transports (Rwanda)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $10,200
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1987/1988
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: World Bank
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/Objectives:

UNCTAD was subcontracted by the World Bank to provide training on the functions of the different transport links in multimodal transport in order to increase awareness of the legal and commercial aspects of such transport, as well as to help assess the feasibility of the establishment of a shippers' council.

(ii) Summary of results:

TRAINMAR courses on multimodal transport were prepared, but difficulties were encountered with delivery owing to lack of trainers and insufficient funds.

A feasibility study on the establishment of a shippers' council was carried out with the help of a consultant and UNCTAD recommended that it be established within the Chamber of Commerce. Work on the creation of a national shippers' council is continuing under project RAF/87/135.

BEN/87/018 - Appui au secteur transport (Benin)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $101,000
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1989/1989
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Secretariat initiative
STATUS OF PROJECT: Completed
EVALUATION: Draft terminal report, September 1989

(i) Nature/objectives:

The aim of the project is to assist the transport sector of Benin in the development of multimodal transport operations, including identification of legal, institutional and operational requirements, facilitation measures and training needs.

(ii) Summary of results:

A five-member team with expertise in different areas, worked closely with counterparts from the Conseil National des Chargeurs du Bénin (CNCB), to identify steps for simplifying, standardizing and harmonizing CNCB documentation, and for the establishment of a National Facilitation Committee. They also formulated proposals for improving freight rate negotiating procedures.

A total of 44 officials from both the public and private sectors attended courses on multimodal transport using the TRAINMAR methodology: recommendations were made for establishing a suitable legal framework for multimodal transport, both nationally and internationally with neighbouring countries having trade transiting through Benin.

A feasibility study has been made on the establishment of a permanent training unit. Further, a follow-up project has been formulated to implement the recommendations.

A draft terminal report concluded that the project had achieved its objectives.

CMR/87/019 - Development du secteur de transport (Cameroon)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $366,200
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1988/1990
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Ongoing
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

This project builds on the activities arising from two previous projects involving major structural adjustments in maritime transport and port infrastructure. Its objective is to improve the entire transport system for the benefit of shippers. Specifically, it seeks to assist small- and medium-sized transport enterprises to resolve institutional and technical problems, and to adapt the legal framework, rendering it more responsive to modern techniques and operating methods.

(ii) Summary of results:

In the project's short initial lifetime (18 months), three quarters of the work plan for 1988/1989 covering a wide range of activities had been carried out. These activities included: analysis of the legislative and operational situation of the country's land transport system and proposals for its restructuring; assistance in improving the insurance market and aiding a local SME in computerizing and managing its insurance portfolio; the identification and installation of a data bank on legal matters on a microcomputer at the Cameroon National Shippers' Council (CNSC); assistance in the establishment of a computerized information system at CNSC covering other aspects in addition to a statistical and economic data bank. While some activities with subregional components are being continued under a subregional project (RAF/88/014), other activities will continue until the end of 1990.

The high rate of implementation was due to very positive local support. The extensive use of local experts helped to reduce the costs of external inputs and to ensure sustainability of the results.

ETH/87/021 - Drafting of the Maritime Code (Ethiopia)
PROJECT ALLOCATIONS/COSTS: $200,000
INCEPTION/COMPLETION: 1988/-
FUNDING SOURCE: UNDP/IPF
ORIGIN OF PROJECT: Government request
STATUS OF PROJECT: Ongoing
EVALUATION: -

(i) Nature/objectives:

The objective is to review and modernize the maritime legislation of the country in order to make it compatible with international conventions and agreements on maritime transport.

(ii) Summary of results:

Three international experts, one of them being designated as co-ordinator, are working separately on different aspects of a comprehensive modern maritime code and related rules. The target date for completion is September 1991. A counterpart team of Ethiopian experts has been appointed to collaborate with the international experts.

It is hoped that the new Code may serve as a model code for use in the PTA region.

ANNEX II

List of projects backstopped by the Shipping Division during the period 1980-1988 a/

Project number	Title of the project	Source of funding	Inception/ completion	Value ($US)
	TRAINMAR			
RAF/76/003	Regional Academy of Sciences (Abidjan - IMO/UNCTAD)	UNDP/IPF	1977/1986	90 300
INT/81/040	TRAINMAR (III)	UNDP/IPF	1982/1986	190 400
RAS/81/072	TRAINMAR Regional Comp. for Asia and the Pacific	UNDP/IPF	1982/1984	231 500
PER/81/013	TRAINMAR (IMO/UNCTAD)	UNDP/IPF	1982/1987	140 500
RAB/82/025	TRAINMAR Arab States	UNDP/IPF	1984/1988	729 900
RLA/82/016	Regional/Subregional Activities Shipping/Ports/Multimodal	UNDP/IPF	1983/1985	51 200
MEX/82/021	TRAINMAR	UNDP/IPF	1985/1986	290 200
TUN/82/A07	TRAINMAR	Tunisia	1982/1987	606 000
INT/83/004	TRAINMAR	UNDP/IPF	1984/1985	18 500
MAL/83/002	TRAINMAR	UNDP/IPF	1983/1984	8 300
MOR/83/006	TRAINMAR	UNDP/IPF	1983/1989	311 400
RAS/84/007	TRAINMAR (Phase III)	UNDP/IPF	1984/1985	366 900
MAL/84/012	TRAINMAR	UNDP/IPF	1985/1986	34 300
SRL/84/016 b/	Port Authority Training Institute	UNDP/IPF	1984/1989	576 900
RAS/85/036	TRAINMAR	UNDP/IPF	1986/1989	894 200
ALG/85/007	Conseils techniques portuaire	UNDP/IPF	1987/1990	308 000
GUA/85/005	Desarrollo Capacitación Puertos y Transporte Marítimo	UNDP/IPF	1985/1986	48 000
IND/85/008 b/	Development of Institute of Port Management	UNDP/IPF	1985/1988	276 400

Project number	Title of the project	Source of funding	Inception/ completion	Value ($US)
MEX/85/002	TRAINMAR Video Programme	UNDP/IPF	1985/1986	18 600
INT/86/004	TRAINMAR	UNDP/IPF	1986/1988	769 400
MAL/86/012	TRAINMAR	UNDP/IPF	1986/1988	128 000
MEX/86/004 b/	TRAINMAR (Emilio Barragan)	UNDP/IPF	1986/1989	428 100
RAF/87/004	TRAINMAR (Portuguese speaking African countries)	UNDP/IPF	1987/1989	250 000
RAF/87/089	Académie Regional Sc. et Technique de la Mer-Abidjan	UNDP/IPF	1987/1990	660 000
RLA/87/A07	Desarollo Capacitación EEC Esfera Puertos y Transp. Marit		1987/1990	205 000
RLA/87/012	TRAINMAR	UNDP/IPF	1987/1989	258 000
EGY/87/012	Training Development in the field of Maritime Transport	UNDP/IPF	1988/1990	283 000
TOTAL for TRAINMAR				9 886 600
	Ports including IPP			
INT/79/A05	IPP - Management of General Cargo Oper.	SIDA	1979/1986	759 600
INT/80/A02	IPP - Assist to Port Mgmt.Ins.	SIDA	1981/1986	48 400
INT/80/A13	IPP - Instructor's seminar	SIDA	1982/1985	216 200
INT/80/A14	IPP - Instructor's seminar	SIDA	1982/1985	150 400
INT/80/A15	IPP - Instructor's seminar	SIDA	1981/1984	159 700
INT/82/A10	IPP - Container Term. Dev.Pol.	SIDA	1983/1987	54 000
INT/82/A11	IPP - Implementing UNCTAD/SIDA Course Manag. General Cargo	SIDA	1983/1989	311 100
INT/83/A04	IPP - Dist. of IPP courses	sales	1983/	375 200
INT/85/A01	IPP - Prep. Training Materials (Port Equipment/Man.)	SIDA	1986/1990	158 000
INT/85/A03	IPP - Trainees Seminar	SIDA	1986/1988	80 000

Project number	Title of the project	Source of funding	Inception/ completion	Value ($US)
PHI/77/012	Development of Manila International Container Terminal	UNDP/IPF	1980/1986	604 700
TUR/78/012	Port Management and Operations Training	UNDP/IPF	1980/1983	108 300
DKR/79/001	Development of Port Facilities	UNDP/IPF	1980/1984	2 118 900
RAF/80/023	Assist Modern.Port Statists & Intro Perform Indic E&S Africa	UNDP/IPF	1981/1984	158 000
ROM/80/001	Port management training	UNDP/IPF	1980/1984	14 800
INT/81/A03	Advisory Service for the Implementation of Port Studies	Netherlands	1981/-	97 200
OMA/81/014	Development of Ports	OMAN	1983/1984	18 400
INT/82/A05	UNCTAD/APEC Container Terminal Manag. Seminars	Belgium	1981/-	247 100
MEX/82/A02	Nat. seminar port oper. & plan	Mexico	1982	69 700
CYP/83/001	Limassol port container terminal	UNDP+Govt	1983/1984	10 500
EQG/83/006	Assistance to Maritime Transport and Creation of PA	UNDP/IPF	1983/1988	236 900
MAT/83/002	Marssaxlokk Container Terminal	UNDP/IPF	1986/1988	95 300
DJI/84/005	Assistance au ports	UNDP/IPF	1985/1989	322 200
STP/84/001	Mechanisation et gestion du port (next RAF/85/024)	UNDP/IPF	1986/1987	121 300
RAF/85/024	Continuation to STP/84/001	UNDP/IPF	1986/1988	136 200
MAR/85/003	Assistance to Economic and Social Development	UNDP/IPF	1986/1989	66 300
PAN/85/002	Capacitacion en la Esfera de Puertos y Transporte Mar.	UNDP+Govt.	1986/1988	169 500
GHA/86/A03	Port operational stat. workshop	Govt.	1986	8 000
KUW/86/004	Advisory Assistance to Public Ports Authority	UNDP/IPF	1989/1989	16 900

Project number	Title of the project	Source of funding	Inception/ completion	Value ($US)
RAF/87/123	Tariff Structures and Cost Accounting Systems	UNDP/IPF	1988/-	420 400
BAR/88/004	Container Terminal Development Seminar	UNDP/IPF	1988/1989	21 200
TOTAL for Ports including IPP				7 374 400
	Shipping other than TRAINMAR			
CAR/80/004 - RLA/79/051	Regional co-operation shipping development	UNDP/IPF	1980/1983	846 000
FIJ/79/002	Feasibility study on Inter-island shipping services	UNDP/IPF	1980/1982	110 900
BEN/80/001	Assistance à la COBENAM	UNDP/IPF	1984/1986	117 400
MAR/81/003	Establishment of a Freight Study Unit	UNDP/IPF	1983/1986	51 700
RAB/87/A04	Feasibility study for OIC	Islamic D.B.	1987/1989	70 000
RAF/87/072	Strengthening Intg. Standing Cttee. of Shipping (ISCOS)	UNDP/IPF	1988/1990	312 000
RAF/87/135	Shipping Policy for Land-locked Countries	UNDP/IPF	1987/-	393 700
INT/88/A01	STRATSHIP (Trust Fund)	Norway	1988/-	278 000
TOTAL for Shipping other than TRAINMAR				2 179 700
	Others			
CUB/76/001	Info. System for Ports & Maritime Transport	UNDP/IPF	1977/1984	1 956 000
CKI/79/001	Improvement inter-island & feeder transport services	UNDP/IPF	1979/1982	161 200
MAG/79/017	Amélioration desserte marit.	UNDP/IPF	1980/1984	159 200
SUR/79/A08	Support for transp. policy & planning	Netherlands	1979/1981	241 600
CPR/80/067	Shipping Data Processing Centre	UNDP/IPF	1981/1985	206 900

Project number	Title of the project	Source of funding	Inception/ completion	Value ($US)
RAF/81/042	Tech Assist.to the Ministerial Conf of West & Central Africa	UNDP/IPF	1982/1988	136 000
IVC/82/004	Etudes organisation et gestion marit. et portuaire	UNDP/IPF	1983/1989	855 900
INT/85/006	Jobmar Feasibility Study	UNDP/IPF	1986/1988	12 200
INT/86/A06	Distribution of Multiship Computer Models	Multi-donors	1986/-	22 000
RWA/86/005	Assistance à la Planification des Transports (IBRD project)	UNDP/IPF	1987/1988	10 200
BEN/87/018	Appui au secteur transport	UNDP/IPF	1988/1989	101 000
CMR/87/019	Développement du secteur de transport	UNDP/IPF	1988/1990	366 200
ETH/87/021	Drafting of the Maritime Code	UNDP/IPF	1988/-	200 000
INT/88/029	On-the-job training in shipping and ports (JOBMAR)	UNDP+others	1989/-	95 000
INT/83/X40 c/	Sectoral support	UNDP		794 900
		Total for others		5 318 300
TOTAL for all projects				24 759 000

Notes

a/ Includes all projects completed up to 1988, projects which had made substantial progress up to 1988 and all training activities, but excludes projects which had just started operations in 1988. Also excluded is a project executed jointly with the Least Developed Programme on "Transit traffic and support to the transport sector in Southern Africa (RAF/86/046), since the first phase of the project started only in 1988 with an evaluation due in July/August 1990.

b/ Only partially TRAINMAR.

c/ Since 1988, mainly but not entirely for maritime and multimodal transport.

ANNEX III

List of TRAINMAR courses

Code	Title	Origin	First delivery
	General methodology		
01.1	Course Development Workshop I	Geneva	July 1980
01.2	Course Development Workshop II	Geneva	January 1981
01.3	Instructor's Workshop	Geneva	March 1982
01.4	Training Management Workshop	Geneva	September 1985
	Ports		
02.1	Port Planning	Geneva	January 1981
02.2	Port Operations for Supervisors	Mombasa	August 1981
02.3	The Port and its Users	Mombasa	August 1981
02.4	General Cargo Operations in a Port Section	Mombasa	April 1984
02.5	Operational Analysis	Mexico	July 1986
02.6	Management of Container Terminal Operations	Manila	September 1984
02.7	Port Administration for Supervisors	Mombasa	November 1984
02.8	Financial Management in Ports	Madras	May 1984
02.9	Management of Equipment Maintenance	Tunis/Geneva Mexico/Casablanca	January 1986
02.10	Cargo Storage and Warehousing	Tunis	December 1984
02.11	Management of Small Ports	Manila	December 1986
02.12	Use of Computerized Information Systems in Ports	Madras	April 1987
02.13	Improving Supervisory Management	Johore	August 1987
02.14	Collection and Management of Port Statistics	Casablanca	December 1987
02.16	Management of Contract Works	Madras	September 1988

Code	Title	Origin	First delivery
02.17	Port Pricing	Washington	December 1988
02.18	Spare parts Management	Madras	May 1989
	Maritime legislation		
03.1	Commercial Aspects of Maritime Law	Abidjan Sharjah Geneva	August 1981
03.2	Maritime Documentary Fraud	Plymouth	May 1988
03.3	Legal Aspects of Chartering	USSR	January 1988
	Shipping		
04.1	Management of Containerized Shipping	Bombay	December 1981
04.2	Cost Control for Shipping Management	Bombay	September 1983
04.3	Use of Computerized Information Systems in Shipping Management	Geneva	January 1985
04.4	Shipping Agency Operations	Geneva/Manila	October 1986
04.5	Finance for Non-finance Shipping Executives	Sharjah	May 1988
04.6	Management of Shipping Financial Arrangements	Sharjah	Being developed
04.7	Marketing and Commercial Policy	Abidjan	December 1989
	Multimodal Transport		
05.1	Multimodal Transport	Geneva	April 1984
05.2	Practical Freight Forwarding	Abidjan	January 1989
05.3	International Distribution: Chartering for Bulk Cargoes	Geneva/ Plymouth	November 1986
05.4	Multimodal Transport Operations Operators (MTOs)	Abidjan/Geneva	January 1989
05.5	Policy Issues for Multimodal Transport	Blantyre	November 1985
05.6	Intensive Workshop on Multimodal Transport for Top Officials	Geneva	March 1987